

《東京セミナー》

基調講演

女性教育のトランスナショナルな展開と国際的ネットワーク

—イギリス・アメリカ・日本—

ジョイス・グッドマン

(翻訳：中込さやか・内山由理)

フックスは教育と学校教育のジェンダー研究は、教育史のなかで最もトランスナショナルな研究が行われている領域のひとつであると強調している。彼は、[文化の]^{トランスファー}移転・^{エクステンジ}交流関係と相互作用に研究の焦点をおく教育と学校教育のジェンダー研究は、新しいアクターと新しい空間^{スペース}に焦点を定めるようになったと述べている¹⁾。フックスの言う新しい空間とは、地理的であると同時に比喩的なものを指している。空間の解釈は、マッシーが、「地球規模の広大な空間から、ごく親密で小さな空間」までと称したような広がりをもっている²⁾。女性はしばしば国民国家の権力から、また国家史研究からも排除されてきた。しかし女性が教育空間を創造し、教育思想を発展させるにつれて、国境を越えた空間や移動の行為主体として可視化されるようになる。国境を越える歴史的なアクターと教育思想の国境を越えた動きを跡付けることは、ジェンダーと教育の歴史家たちに実り豊かな研究の道筋を保証している。たとえば山崎(洋子)氏が組織した2015年の国際教育史学会(ISCHE)のパネルは、トランスナショナルなアプローチは日本と西洋の異文化間の相互活動について、魅力的な多角的研究を生むことを示した³⁾。

私は長年イングランド以外の国で暮らしていたので、国境を越える女性に興味を持つようになった。手始めに、私はイギリス帝国の空間と交渉した女性の教師と校長の研究に引き付けられた。まもなく私は、国際連盟のような場所や国際大学女性連盟(International Federation of University Women, 以下 IFUW)のような組織において、帝国主義の歴史と国際主義の歴史が交錯する様を目の当たりにした。これらの組織は、女性たちが、私的で知的な政治目標を追求し、女性と少女の教育のトランスナショナルなネットワークという考えを発展させることを可能にした。最近の私のトランスナショナルな研究は、比較教育史における女性の立場と彼女たちが^{コネクト}つながりを理解するために、どのように比較という

方法を用いたのかに注目している。

本報告は4つの節からなっている。第一に国家を超えた様々な歴史へのアプローチについて、第二にトランスナショナルなアプローチと新しい帝国史について、第三に交錯の歴史(entangled histories)と協調の言語 (languages of cooperation) について、最後にトランスナショナルな関与と国家・地域の構造についてである。では、まずグローバル・ヒストリー、世界史、トランスナショナル・ヒストリー、トランスローカル・ヒストリーなどとさまざまな呼び名で呼ばれている、国家を超えた歴史への様々なアプローチについて、概観することから始めたい。

国家を超えた歴史

フックスは、グローバル・ヒストリーが国民国家を超えた、あるいはその延長上に、トランスナショナルでグローバルな統治、領土権、主権という論点を提示すると指摘している⁴⁾。彼は、グローバルな文化秩序の収束過程に言及する世界システム論について論じている。フックスは、世界システム論の特徴を数点見いだしている。普遍主義、個人主義、進歩への信念、目的合理性、自律的活動、そして世界市民権である⁵⁾。バルコヴィッチは、女性の権利とグローバルな言説について世界システム論的な見方を説明している。彼女は、女性の境遇の改善をめぐる新たに浮上した世界的な社会問題を論じている。彼女は、女性と子どもの保護についての戦間期の言説に注目している。国ごとの個別研究や、国家間の比較研究において、自国を例外的ものとみなそうとする傾向があり、彼女が言うには、それは国家間に共通する事項を覆い隠してしまうのだが、世界システム論的アプローチはこうした傾向を克服していると、バルコヴィッチは主張する。これに代わって、バルコヴィッチは、相異なる動向は、同一の過程がグローバルな文脈によって違った形で現われた結果であると考えている。バルコヴィッチにとって、グローバルな文脈は、一般的には、国家の構造と活動、特に女性の問題に関する主要な決定要因であるのだ⁶⁾。

マズリッシュと入江は、世界史の研究者は過去の歴史全体を扱うことを主題としているが⁷⁾ グローバリゼーションを研究する歴史家は、グローバリゼーションの諸要因のひとつひとつを扱うことに研究上の焦点をおくとみている⁸⁾。フックスは世界史とグローバル・ヒストリーという言葉はしばしば互換的に用いられていると指摘する。カルーソは教育のグローバル・ヒストリーについて、世界システム論、世界社会論、世界政体論から理論的な見通しを示している。バルコヴィッチと同様に、カルーソはこれらのアプローチは、近代化、変化、拡張についてのグランド・ナラティブ (大きな物語) を示すことによって、

「トランスナショナルに拡がる教育の領域の出現、普及、そして多様な制度化」に対して豊かな洞察を提供すると主張している⁹⁾。世界システム論的アプローチへの批判は、その階層序列的で、トップダウン的なアプローチとそのヨーロッパ中心主義的に定義された世界社会論にむけられている¹⁰⁾。これに対しカルーソは、より洗練された考えを持っており、グローバリゼーションというジャンルは一方向へ向かう行為ではなく、「せめぎ合う物語と格闘し合う諸力の空間を切り開いている」と論じる。彼はグローバルな諸力の作用とグローバルな規模での特殊な因果関係を考えることは、必ずしも概念や統一性と密接に結びついた歴史へと逆戻りするわけではないと結論づけている。グローバル・ヒストリーが歴史家たちに投げかけているのは、地域、地方、国家の諸要因と緊張関係にある別のレベルの因果関係を示すことであると、カルーソは主張している¹¹⁾。ハースト、トンプソン、ブルムリーはグローバリゼーションを インターナショナルリゼーション 国際化と区別する。彼らは、国際化は国民国家の概念に基づいた諸機関によって推進されたと理解し、他方でグローバリゼーションは、トランスナショナルな組織に基づいた諸現象、もしくは諸活動であると考えている¹²⁾。

ヴァートヴェックは、トランスナショナリズムを国民国家間の境界線を横断する人びとや制度を結びつける複合的なつながりや相互作用と定義している¹³⁾。これらの相互作用は、慣習、帰属意識、制度、伝統の重層的なネットワークを形成する¹⁴⁾。それゆえに、トランスナショナルな研究における歴史的なパースペクティブは、国境や様々な境界線を越えて、あるいは横断して人々が居住する社会的な空間を吟味することに向けられる¹⁵⁾。ガイヤーはトランスナショナル・ヒストリーの三つの特徴を示している。第一に、絶えず変化する状態で存在し、国家的な分類に陥らない非国家的なアクターと空間に焦点をおくこと。非国家的なアクターと再定義された空間に注目することは、明らかに女性の教育史を読み解くうえで有効である。この方法は、女性、少女、彼女たちの公式・非公式な教育についての ナラティブ 語り を構築する際の史料の幅も広げてくれる¹⁶⁾。第二に、ガイヤーは、トランスナショナル・ヒストリーは国家史を拡張するものともなりえると主張する¹⁷⁾。さらに、この点は、国家の歴史に女性の活動を描き入れるうえで役立ってきた¹⁸⁾。第三に、ガイヤーは、トランスナショナル・ヒストリーを、国民国家の発展をグローバルな現象として検討することだとみなしている¹⁹⁾。ヴァートヴェックと同様に、グラント、レヴァイン、トレントマンらもまた、彼（女）らがトランスローカルな理解と称している、場の再構築の観点からトランスナショナリズムを理解している²⁰⁾。

トランスローカル・ヒストリーは、地域研究にトランスナショナリズムを用いようとしている。フックスによれば、トランスローカル・ヒストリーは、ローカルな空間と、文化的・社会的・政治的な構造や秩序の構築および制度化の関係を描こうとしているという²¹⁾。汎太平洋の女性の組織についてのペイズリーの研究²²⁾と太平洋の国際化に関するアカミの研究はどちらも、トランスローカルなアプローチをトランスナショナルな見解とうまく結びつけている²³⁾。

次節では、トランスナショナリズムと帝国論的「転回」について議論したい。

トランスナショナリズムと帝国論的転回

グラント、レヴァイン、トレントマンは、トランスナショナリズムの根源を帝國的なものであると見ている。彼らは帝国が、トランスナショナルな社会文化運動が展開される決定的に重要な場であったと議論している²⁴⁾。女性の教育史に関するトランスナショナルな見方についての私の関心は、女性教師たちがイギリス帝国の内外を移動して活動していたことをきっかけに広がった²⁵⁾。トランスナショナルな研究にとって、教師は女性のなかでもとりわけ研究成果の多い集団である。旅行記からは、女性教師たちが「独立して生計をたてている女性」トラベラーとして、特権的な立場にあったことがうかがえる。しかし、タンブクが指摘するように、旅する女性教師たちは決してこの範疇には収まり切れなかった。戦間期には、イングランドから移動した女性教師たちは、結婚退職を求められたため、未婚であったようだ。しかし、旅する女性教師のなかには移動にかかる費用を家族収入に頼ることのできない労働者階級出身の教育ある女性も含まれていた。タンブクが注目するように、教師の旅は気の向くままに各地を巡るようなロマンティックな旅ではなかった。教師の旅は「秩序正しく、目的のある」もので、自らの教育や仕事の向上のためであることが多かった。それでも旅は女性教師たちに、現実と想像の両面の「別世界」で、それまでの自分とは別の存在になりうるという経験をもたらしたのだった²⁶⁾。

エレン・ノックス (Ellen Knox, 1858-1924) はイングランドとカナダの間を何度も移動した女性であり、タンブクの指摘の例証となっている。彼女はイングランドのチェルトナム・レディーズ・カレッジのドロシア・ビール(Dorothea Beale, 1831-1906)の下で教師としての訓練を受けて教鞭をとった後、ハバガル・カレッジ (Havergal College) の創設者兼校長としてトロントを訪れた²⁷⁾。帝国が、教師の専門職アイデンティティを「内=本国(home)」と「外=植民地(away)」の両面を融合して形作る^{サイト}場であったことを、彼女の物語は浮き彫りにする。ノックスはイングランドで人生前半の35年を過ごし、その後カナダ

で残りの30年を過ごした。彼女のアイデンティティにおいて、カナダという国の定義は英国に由来していたが、カナダで過ごす中で獲得され、その他の影響とも混ざりあったものだった。ノックスのような女性にとって、移動の可能性は、20世紀初頭以降の女性教師の専門職アイデンティティを形成した職業、職歴と人柄に関する西洋の言説の諸側面を際立たせている。ノックスの物語は、教師の専門職アイデンティティを再構築するための、帝国と植民地間の移動空間と移動という過程自体の重要性も指摘することができる。ノックスは一人で旅に出ることもあったが、時にはハバガル・カレッジ出身の教師とともに旅をした。またある時には、ハバガルの教師に採用したイングランド出身の教師たちと一緒にカナダに戻った。教師たちが通商と帝国の航路を旅する間、境界を移動する空間では、船が教師たちに会話の機会をあたえ、教師としてのアイデンティティを再構築する機会を提供した²⁸⁾。

海外の帝国主義的な関係によって、イングランド女性の専門職者同士の関係が変容するという考え方は、「帝国論的転回」と呼ばれるようになったものと共鳴する²⁹⁾。帝国史は世界中の政治的、社会的な変化の相互依存と相互関連性を見出す学識を発展させた³⁰⁾。

「帝国論的転回」の観点から考えると、帝国とは、教師や他の人々が帝国への流入・流出あるいは帝国内を移動するにつれて、教育上の経歴が形成される関係網であったことがわかる³¹⁾。

新しい帝国史は、従来の教育と帝国の研究の特徴であった「中心」から「周縁」へと向かう一方向性の流れから決別を遂げた³²⁾。多くの学者は、一方向性の流れが、チャクラバルティの言う「歴史の待合室」に人々を押し込む進化論のシェーマと結びつく点で問題の多いことを指摘している³³⁾。チャクラバルティは、西洋の進歩概念や比較枠組みに関する歴史記述の概念は一時的な本質を宿しているにすぎないし、「キャッチアップ」の概念も一時的なものであることを強調している³⁴⁾。柴田政子らは日本の教育に関する記述において、この西洋植民地主義の枠組みがいかに貫徹しているかを読み解いている³⁵⁾。高橋裕子は日本のフェミニストたちがどのようにジェンダー・ギャップの「悪い報道」を用いて、解決されるべき問題を提示してきたのか³⁶⁾——これは日本の女性の学びの長い伝統を見過ごしているのだが——について説明している³⁷⁾。「キャッチアップ」の概念は、日本女性の演説に関する西洋側の報道に影響を与えている。トランスナショナル研究者はこのことに注意すべきだろう。

1921年にボストンのウエルズリー・カレッジで井上秀〔1875～1963〕が行った演説の報道はまさにこの枠組みが用いられている。同カレッジの「大学便り」には、井上を日本

婦人平和協会の会長、東京の日本女子大学の学部長として紹介している。それは井上の演説の主要なポイントを伝え、日本人女性がアメリカ人女性に軍備縮小法案を支持するよう訴えるものであったことに注目している。また、井上は夏に開催されたパリの IFUW 会議に出席するつもりであったことが書かれている。

井上夫人はコロンビア大学で7年間学んでいました。彼女は先週の木曜日にプリンマー・カレッジを出発した後、東部のいくつかのカレッジに出向き、日本女子大学をアメリカの水準に引き上げるために、アメリカの組織運営を学んでいる。井上夫人を招いたアリーズ・ラッセル夫人によれば、井上夫人は特にプリンマー・カレッジに興味を持ったという。というのもプリンマー大学とその学長は日本ではとてもよく知られているからだそう³⁸⁾。

井上の声明に関する報道は、西洋文化および西洋国家に属する女性に比べて、非西洋人の女性たちは教育と市民権において遅れているという語りを繰り返している³⁹⁾。対照的に、研究者たちは井上が日本支部の会長を務めた婦人国際平和自由連盟の日本人会員の重要性を指摘している⁴⁰⁾。安武留美も、日本人女性を中心に汎大西洋女性組織のような組織が設立されと説明している⁴¹⁾。日本人女性は、自分たちが選択した理想を前進させるなかで、主要な西洋人女性と人脈を築くことができた。例えば 1928 年の汎太平洋女性会議において、井上と井出菊江〔神戸女学院大学教授、大阪婦人問題研究所〕は、アメリカのジェーン・アダムズ (Jane Adams, 1860~1935) やオーストラリアのベッシー・リスベス (Bessie Rischbieth, 1874~1967) とともに会議の継続委員会のメンバーであった⁴²⁾。

安武によるアメリカと日本のトランスナショナルな女性の活動についての研究や、東栄一郎による日本人移民の人種、階級に関する交渉方法についての研究は⁴³⁾、国境を超えた政治的・社会的な要因の相互関連性の重要性を説明している。こうした研究は、トランスナショナルな空間では相互関連性と交錯の重要性だけでなく、また相互関連性に内在する権力関係も重要であることを指摘している。

次に、相互関連性を強調したトランスナショナリズムと交錯の歴史について議論しよう。

トランスナショナリズムと交錯の歴史

ソベは「交錯の歴史」のアプローチは、学校と学校制度の歴史的発展とその運営におけ

るトランスカルチュラルな相互作用について考えるうえで有益な手段であると指摘している⁴⁴⁾。交錯の歴史のアプローチは、トランスナショナルな空間における運動と交流の相互関連性に注目している。交錯の歴史は、国境を往来するにつれて、交錯が理念と実践にどのように影響したかに焦点をあてる。ワーナーとツィメルマンは交錯の歴史においては、関連性・相互作用・循環という文脈から、研究のテーマと対象は互いに関連しあうばかりか、互いに手段となっていると考えられることを提示している⁴⁵⁾。交錯の歴史の基本的な想定は、境界を横断するプロセスで何かが生じるということであり、そのことが歴史家に往来の結果に注目することを求めると、ワーナーとツィメルマンは主張する⁴⁶⁾。また彼らは、横断とは、交差し、混ざり合い、時には互いにすれ違いかねない程の速さで移動することだと論じている。このアプローチは横断の過程で発生し展開する、抵抗、遅滞、修正、新しい結合を分析しようとしている⁴⁷⁾。

フェアブルッヘンとカルリエは、ヨーロッパ大陸におけるアメリカの児童図書館のパラダイムのトランスナショナルな文化移転と変容を調べるにあたり、交錯の歴史のアプローチを用いている。彼らはゲント児童図書館を、社会改良、教育改革とフェミニズムの絡み合いが組み込まれた先進事例とみなす。彼らはベルギーの「受け手」の(インフォーマルな)社会的ネットワークから分析を始めている。彼らはアメリカからベルギーへの文化移転に注目するだけでなく、そのロンドンへの到来と、イギリスとオランダにおいてトインビー・セツルメント運動のなかで組織された児童演劇時間の研究も視野に入れている。彼らは、相互作用や相互の影響について言及することができるか否かを細かく調査し、交錯の歴史の視点を用いて、国際的な協議会や機関紙を通じた多国家間の転移を明らかにしている。彼らはフェミニスト、社会生活改良家 (social Lebens-reformers)、進歩主義教育家の部分的に重なり合う知的ネットワークから、トランスナショナルな過程における交錯した歴史を明らかにしている。彼らは諸集団のネットワークが作られる上で、知的な社交は重要な要素であったことを立証している⁴⁸⁾。

フェアブルッヘンとカルリエによれば、知的なソシアビリテは、戦間期のトランスナショナルな絡まりを円滑にするメカニズムの一つであった。ソシアビリテは、科学的国際主義と絡み合っていたことから、戦間期の文化的国際主義の重要な側面であった。文化的な国際主義も、科学的な国際主義も、第一次大戦中と戦後に発達した「新国際主義(new internationalism)」に埋めこまれた協調の言語から構築されたものである。

次に、新しい国際的な秩序を創造するという趨勢のなかで発達した協調の言語に話を移そう。

トランスナショナリズムと協調の言語

戦間期には、自由主義的な国際主義が協調の言語によって表現され、協調の言語は著名な知識人たちに、国際関係や国家主権についてそれまでとは異なる語り方をさせるようになった。協調の言語を紐解くにあたり、私はトロローラーの研究に依拠した。トロローラーは、人々がどのように考え、話し、書くかを様式として描くにあたって、「言語 (languages)」という概念の有効性を説明している。トロローラーに従い、私は「協調の言語」という言葉を、ソシユールの開発したパロール (*parole*) とラング (*langue*) の区分に基づきながら、理論的な規則体系として用いる。トロローラーは、このような意味で、諸言語は思考の諸様式を示しているとする。彼は言語とはすなわちレトリックと語彙をもち、行為者の言葉の枠組を構成するものであるとする。トロローラーは、この意味で、言語は認知されたものを社会的現実とし解釈すると論じている。彼はどの時代にも、そこでの現象を認知し、分析し、議論をする支配的な様式が存在し、他方で、その背後や潜行して作動する別の様式も存在すると指摘している。支配的な様式の変化は、人々が自分たちの状況をもっと適切な方法で記述するために別の言語の助けを求めるようになった危機から生まれる。言語がトランスナショナルであること、そして国家の範疇を超えていることこそ、トロローラーが議論よりも言語を重視する何よりの理由である⁴⁹⁾。

戦間期の「新国際主義」を支えた協調の言語は、国際的な秩序の文化的、知的、心理的な側面へのエリートたちの関与と、ポピュラー・カルチャーを通じた世論形成によって、平和が促進されうるという信念に基づいていた⁵⁰⁾。協調の言語では、世界は相互依存的な集団で構成されていた。トレントマンは、主権は内向的であり、「外国人に対して身構える」が、協調は外向的で「見知らぬもの、外国のものを、承認された共通利害のための協調...要素へと変容させるのだ」と主張している。その結果、協調は国民国家をこえて国際的な精神性を共有することができるのだという。トレントマンが主張するには、協調は個別の国民国家の立憲主権を否定することなしに⁵¹⁾、そうするのだ。さらに、協調は、外交政策において、広い視野を持った空間を提供する⁵²⁾。戦間期に、協調の言語は、世界国家の概念に基づく集権化する言語に代わる選択肢を提供した⁵³⁾。

国際連盟における教育をめぐる議論では、協調の言語と集権化の言語が争いを演じた。1921年にジュネーブで知的協力国際委員会 (International Committee on Intellectual Co-operation, 以下 ICIC) の提案がなされた時、委員会設置の提案の草案に含まれていた教育という単語は省かれていた。それは国際教育局 (International Bureau of

Education) の創設計画においても同様だった。様々な国の教育の「進歩」についての情報を集める国際事務局は、国連が国民教育制度に「介入」する状況を避けるために、このような除外をしたし⁵⁴⁾、世界国家の創設に向けた運動にも同じことがいえた⁵⁵⁾。マリー・キュリー (Marie Curie, 1867~1934) は 1930 年に初等教育が井 ICIC や知的協調に関するパリ協会 (IIIC) の実行計画になかったことについて、当時の議論の状況を次のように端的に述べている。「それは最初から公式に禁じられていた。委員会は政府の決定に関する諸問題について他国に一切の介入もできなかつたからだ」と。教育は「棚上げされた領域」だったので。ICIC のメンバーであったアルフレッド・ロッコ (Alfred Rocco, 1875~1935) も、児童の発達は国家主権の最も関心を寄せるものの一つとみなされているので、その問題を扱うことは危険であると述べた⁵⁶⁾。

協調の言語は、「国際協調の精神(international mind)」という用語で明示され、「新自由主義思想の発展を通じて国家主義と国際主義を連結させた」⁵⁷⁾。「国民協調の精神」とはアメリカのコロンビア大学のニコラス・マレー・バトラー (Nicholas Murray Butler) による造語である。

国家は国際関係の道徳的問題に影響を与えることになるはずの精神と良心を持っていると、バトラーは、考えていた。彼は、「国際協調の精神」は、情熱にまさる理性の発展によって創られたもので、様々な国の人々が互いを共通の目的に向けて働く友人として理解するための必須手段であると考えていた⁵⁸⁾。ICIC の副理事長であったアルフレッド・ジマーン (Alfred Zimmern, 1879-1957) によれば、「国際協調の精神」には心情な側面があった。ジマーンにとって、理性を通して国際的な問題を理解することは、より進歩的な意見やより幅広い国際情報にかかわるだけではなかつた。それは、国民間の関係に関する知識や、国民自身についての知識を含むものだった⁵⁹⁾。彼は、「外国の精神、すなわち馴染みのない方法で作用する精神に」触れ、「喜びと冒険心を抱いてそれらと出会う」⁶⁰⁾ことを学ぶ特別な態度を発達させることは、「国民と国民の間に新しい心的態度」⁶¹⁾を生み出すと考えていた。

バーナード・カレッジの学部長であったヴァージニア・ギルダスリーヴ (Virginia Gildersleeve, 1877-1965) は、「国民協調の精神」について IFUW の女性たちに語り掛けた。彼女は、「国民協調の精神」を、「競争より国際協調を、また敵対的な疑念よりも友好的な理解を標準なものとして受け入れること」であると説いた。ギルダスリーヴは、人種心理学の存在が、人々に異なる根本的な概念や慣習や価値を抱かせるために、真の「国際理解」を困難になっていると考えた。彼女は諸国民がよりよい世界をめざして協調するた

めに必要なことは、「思考、理解、友好、協調の網を編む」ことであり、そのことを「心と精神の見えないフィラメント」と称した⁶²⁾。ジマーンと同様に、ギルダスリーヴは、「国際協調の精神」は、国民の心のなかに国際的な視野の育くむことを必要すると考えていた⁶³⁾。

ギルダスリーヴの「思考、理解、友好、協調の網を編む」という表現は、協調の言語を明確化する二つの主要な側面を統合したものである。それは科学的国際主義に則った思考の合理性と、国際主義にいつそう文化的にアプローチする親善の感情である。これらの要素が、ギルダスリーヴの議長を務めた IFUW におけるトランスナショナルなネットワークと交流には織り込まれていた。

次に、IFUW を取り上げて科学的国際主義と文化的国際主義の混交を検討してみよう。

科学的国際主義と文化的国際主義

IFUW は、世界規模での女性の科学と高等教育へのアクセスを確実にするために設立され、「アカデミックな女性たちを支援するトランスナショナルなネットワーク」へと発展した⁶⁴⁾。IFUW は北米とイギリスの女性達によって、異なる国の女性大学人の友情と理解を促し、彼女たちの利益を追求するために設立された⁶⁵⁾。初代連盟会長キャロライン・スパージョン (Caroline Spurgeon, 1869–1942) は、IFUW の三重の目的を、国際的友情、学習と知識における国際主義、そして全般的に教育のプロセスを発展させ、広げ、豊かにすることであるとまとめた⁶⁶⁾。

国際連盟と同じく、IFUW は科学的国際主義を促進し、国際主義の精神を創り出すことをエキスパートの重要な役割であるとみなした。国際連盟 (SDN) の出版物では、知識人の文化的権威は、「それ抜きでは世界平和のための法的協定が力も活気も失ってしまう、心的態度における一致」を促進する知識人の責務の一部として、客観的知識を提供する点から描かれた⁶⁷⁾。知的協力国際協会 (International Institute of Intellectual Cooperation, IIIC) の事務局長アンリ・ボネ (Henri Bonnet, 1888-1978) は、「私心のない知識」は「他分野の活動での協調と平和の道筋をひらくための最良の手段」として政治的に利用できると述べた⁶⁸⁾。個々の国民国家間の協力に基づいた枠組みの中で、科学は協力的国際主義の実践を形成するために働きかけた。シュテファン・フリッツは、経験的事実の発見とそれらの合理的応用は、支配国の利害に基づく国際関係の見方を、国際的な科学的コミュニティの中で適用される知識に基づく見方に置き換えることで、社会的協調を促進すると主張する⁶⁹⁾。国際連盟の技術セクションは、幅広い国々から特定の国際問題に対処する能力

によって選ばれた「いわゆる独立したエキスパート」を参加させた⁷⁰⁾。国際連盟の実践を反映して、IFUW はその委員会の女性メンバーを特定の組織の代表としてではなく、完全にエキスパートとして選出した⁷¹⁾。

IFUW の活動の最も重要な部門の一つは、芸術と科学の研究と旅行のための女性対象の奨学基金であった。IFUW の奨学金計画は、女性たちが利用可能であった少数の国際的奨学基金の再調整を行うものであった。そして、その計画は研究が急速に国際的ネットワークの中で行われるようになった時代に、海外での研究機会にアクセスできるようにすることを目的とした。知識を増大させ、女性たちの学問的環境を支えるため、大学院生の研究のための国際奨学金授与は、最高度の知的水準を基準にして決定された。応募者の個人的状況はまったく考慮されなかった⁷²⁾。海外での国際的フェローとしての経験は、個人的に他国と関わることで、他国民と国際関係についての知識をつけると考えられた。このようにして、科学的国際主義と文化的国際主義の考えは、ギルダスリーヴが「国民協調の精神」の要素とみなした「心と精神の見えないフィラメント」として融合した⁷³⁾。

IFUW の女性大学人たちのトランスナショナルなネットワーク創造の中心となったのは、ロンドンのクロスビー・ホール (Crosby Hall) とパリのリード・ホール (Reid Hall) だった⁷⁴⁾。クロスビー・ホールは国際的な寮として整えられ、図書室、食堂、クラブ室を備えた。ロンドンで勉学や研究を行う女性大学人たちや旅行中の IFUW メンバーたちが有料でクロスビー・ホールを利用した。クロスビー・ホールは、クロスビー・ホール「精神」と呼ばれる、異文化間の交流を促進するオープンな国際的エートスをはぐくんだが⁷⁵⁾、それはジュネーヴ「精神」の表現と共鳴した⁷⁶⁾。クロスビー・ホールは IFUW のホスピタリティの基盤の中心となった。海外からの宿泊者たちがイギリス大学女性連盟 (British Federation of University Women, 以下 BFUW) の地方組織の女性たちと会うために、イギリスの他地域への訪問が計画され、個々の BFUW メンバーが海外からの女子学生たちの世話人となった⁷⁷⁾。紹介状、社交プログラム、イベント、歓迎、留学引受人、茶会、訪問などのすべてが、女性研究者たちのトランスナショナルなネットワークの創造を順調に進めるのに役立った⁷⁸⁾。

我々は、そのホスピタリティの一片を、私が前に引用した井上の留学引受人、アリーズ・ラッセル夫人 (Mrs. Alys Russel) に言及した「大学便り」に見ることができる⁷⁹⁾。アメリカ人のアリーズ・スミス・ラッセルはプリンマー大学学部長ケアリー・トマス (Carey Thomas, 1857-1935) の姪である。ラッセルは、家族でイングランドに移住し、イギリス人哲学者バートランド・ラッセル (Bertrand Russel, 1872-1970) の妻となる以

前の時期に、プリンマー・カレッジに通っていた⁸⁰⁾。人的交流に恵まれ、旅行をよくした裕福な女性で、BFUW と IFUW の指導的な名士となったラッセルは、トランスナショナルな生活の典型的な例である⁸¹⁾。クロスビー・ホールや BFUW と IFUW でのネットワークのための資金供給やホスピタリティの中心にいたラッセルの活動は、ソーニエの言うトランスナショナルな「^{コネクター}接合者」の役割にあたる。「接合者」は資源を動員し、トランスナショナリズムが作用する異なるレベルを横断する存在である⁸²⁾。ラッセルが従事した茶会やレセプションのようなジェンダー化された活動は、国際的な交友やホスピタリティを接合するのに重要であった。このことが女性たちの活動を促進し、学者のトランスナショナルなネットワークの形成に貢献した。

クロスビー・ホール・ホスピタリティ委員会でのラッセルの働きは、学者のトランスナショナルなネットワークの中にコスモポリタンな団結を定着させる、コスモポリタンなソシアビリテの一面だった⁸³⁾。コスモポリタンなソシアビリテの中、人々はトランスナショナルな動きを広める共通の場を創造する実践の中で、積極的な当事者となる⁸⁴⁾。シラー、ダリーエヴァ&グリュナー=ドミクは、ソシアビリテを、多様な他者と関係をつくるという人間の共通した能力に基づく相互作用の形式であると定義する。彼らは、コスモポリタンなソシアビリテは、「世界に対する開放性と包括性を持つ社会的関係を創造するという人間が潜在的にもつ力に基づいた能力とコミュニケーション・スキルの諸様式」から成ると見ている。彼らは、コスモポリタンなソシアビリテは、文化や信仰によって分かたれているように見えても、共通する人間としての経験という側面を見いだすことのできる能力であると論じる。そして、コスモポリタンなソシアビリテは、異なる歴史的コンテキストとロケーションにおいて妨害されたり、促進されたりしながらも、社会的関係や経験に基づくアイデンティティの内部で成立し、埋め込まれるものだと主張している⁸⁵⁾。

IFUW のトランスナショナルなネットワーク内でのソシアビリテも、ソシアビリテがその実践の状況によって形作られ、エスニシティや「人種」の力関係によって交差する可能性をもった道筋を明示する⁸⁶⁾。IFUW のトランスナショナルなネットワークでは、コスモポリタンなソシアビリテは IFUW の欧米外の大学人女性たちとの繋がりという点で制限されていた⁸⁷⁾、また IFUW 会議が主に英語で行われたという点でも制限された⁸⁸⁾。サンデルいわく、これはヨーロッパ外からの西洋言語に堪能で西洋文化や女性の活動に慣れ親しんだ「西洋化された」女性たちに好都合な動きである⁸⁹⁾。サンデルは、彼女たちの相互作用は、西洋風の教育や、またしばしばキリスト教との繋がりによって容易なものとなったという⁹⁰⁾。

最後に、私は河井道[1877~1953]の1921年の渡欧・渡米を取り上げて、組織の設立、ネットワークと、トランスナショナルな関与の契機の関係性について考えたい。

トランスナショナルな関与の構築

1920年までに河井は津田塾での教職を辞し、日本YWCAのフルタイムの幹事となっていた。この時点ですでに、河井は豊かな人的交流網を持ち、経験を積んだ旅行者でもあった。彼女はフィラデルフィアのプリンマー大学とニューヨークのYWCA全米幹事養成学校(YWCA National Training School)で学んでいた。河井は欧州、カナダ、アメリカの聴衆の前で演説したことがあった⁹¹⁾。河井は『わたしのランタン (*My Lantern*)』の中で、1920年に高等教育を受けるためにコロンビア大学に向かっていた渡辺ゆりと共にニューヨークに旅したことを記録する。道中、二人の女性たちはオハイオ州クリーヴランドで開かれたアメリカYWCAの2年ごとに開催される大会に出席した。ニューヨークで河井はハリエット・テイラー (Harriet Taylor) に会い、ともにスイスのシャンベリ (Chambéry) での世界YWCA中央委員会に出席するために渡欧した。シャンベリの後、河井は近郊のジュネーヴでの国際女性同盟 (International Alliance of Women。以下IAW) に立ち寄った。『わたしのランタン』で言及されていないのは、河井がロンドンのIFUW会議に参加したことである。

河井はクリーヴランドのアメリカYWCA大会にて「より良い国際理解のための嘆願」を行ったと記す⁹²⁾。世界YWCAの会合で、河井はアジア地区を代表する名誉副会長に任命された。だが、河井はこのことを、この時点では、『わたしのランタン』には記録していない⁹³⁾。しかし河井は、IAWで彼女が「オリエンタルな」代表の演壇に配置されたと書き留めている⁹⁴⁾。ところが、IFUW会議において日本で出された女性の高等教育のための嘆願書について話したことには触れていない⁹⁵⁾。

河井の旅行記は以下のようになっている。

1920年4月13~20日

アメリカYWCA、第6回全国大会、クリーヴランド、オハイオ

1920年6月11~14日

世界YWCA会議、シャンペリ、スイス

1920年6月12日

国際女性同盟 (IAW)、第8回大会、ジュネーヴ、スイス (この会議は1920年6月6~12日まで開催され、河井は最後のセッションに出席したもよう。)

1920年7月

国際大学女性連盟 (IFUW)、第1回大会、ロンドン

河井によるジュネーヴでのIAWについての報告を、オハイオのクリーヴランド会議と対比することは有益である。河井は国際同盟について以下のように述べる。

一晩が東洋諸国の代表に割り当てられ、私は有名な日本人ソーシャルワーカーのガントレット (山田) 恒子夫人 (Mrs. Tsune Yamada Gauntlett, 1873-1953) や、金銀で飾られた素晴らしい衣装の7人のヒンドゥー女性たちと共に演壇に上がるよう招待された。その中には有名な女流詩人ナイドゥ夫人 (Mrs Naidu, 1879-1949) もいて、彼女は芸術的な身振りで雄弁に語った。彼女はまたヒンドゥーの女性弁護士でもある⁹⁶⁾。

ペイズリーは、衣服が国民を識別する目印となった過程について述べる⁹⁷⁾。サンデルは、そのような報告は、国際的な女性組織がアジアからの女性たちの参加を重要視していたことを示すと論じる。アジア女性の参加は、組織の国際性の物差しとして見られた。その意味で、サンデルは女性が国際主義の「シンボル」となったという⁹⁸⁾。我々はこのことを、キャリー・チャップマン・キャット (Carrie Chapman Catt, 1859-1947) の演説についての河井による書き記し方に読み取ることができる。河井は以下のように記録する。

これは私にとって初めての女性参政権の大会で、私はキャット夫人の率直な物言いに衝撃を受けた。「ジュネーヴのみなさん」、彼女のはっきりとした声は言った。

「あなた方はここにいる東洋の姉妹たちがすでに市民権を得ていることを知っていますか？ジュネーヴの女性のみなさん、あなた方は日本が女性参政権に向けて動いていることを知っていますか？世界各地からおいでになったみなさん、あなた方はなぜ女性参政権を否定するのですか？」⁹⁹⁾

サロジーニ・ナイドゥの雄弁さと詩的なジェスチャーと、キャリー・チャップマン・キャットのはっきりとした声と率直な振る舞いについての河井のコメントは、河井が国際舞台に女性が異なる方法で臨んでいることに対して深く考えたことを示す。

クリーヴランドのアメリカ YWCA 大会では、河井は全く異なる状況に遭遇した¹⁰⁰⁾。44人のアフリカ系アメリカ人女性たちがクリーヴランド大会に出席していた。アフリカ系アメリカ人出席者たちにとっては、アメリカ YWCA 内の人種間の協力が問題となった。彼女たちの人種間協力の実践をめぐる苦闘は、キリスト教市民権とキリスト教国際主義の核心に迫るものであった。クリーヴランド大会で、合衆国最古のアフリカ系アメリカ人向け私立大学であるウィルバーフォース大学 (Wilberforce University) の代表、クレメンティン・ホッジス (Clementine Hodges) は、「800 人の黒人少女たち」のために YWCA メンバーシップを拡大するよう呼びかけた。これは、ホッジスによると「わが人種やアングロ・サクソン人種のためだけでなく、全宇宙の住人のための利益となる」ものだった。さらに、ホッジスは「より包摂的な組織が新しい世界を創る」と述べた。ロバートソンは、YWCA の白人アメリカ人会員に受け入れられた通念は、そのような理想が活動家を支援することを意図しているもので、しかも大半の白人アメリカ人メンバーの頭のなかにあった活動家は白人であったと言及する。しかし、アフリカ系アメリカ人会員たちは、しばしばそのなかに、「あらゆる生活状態におかれた、すべての人間の権利と正義」のためという YWCA の立ち位置に関する人種的メッセージを読み取った。大会で、黒人 YWCA 支部の代表、メアリ・J・マックロリー (Mary J. McCrorey) は、これを、「この仕事を南部一帯に広めるための、そして我々の人種の女性たちにこの組織のもつ偉大な特権を付与するための」機会と結びつけた¹⁰¹⁾。

1920 年のクリーヴランド大会の頃、多くのアメリカ YWCA 支部は人種に応じて区別されていた。黒人 YWCA メンバー向けに区別された支部は、しばしば白人メンバー向けの支部より設備が劣っていた。権力と自治の問題もまた、アメリカ YWCA を人種に応じて分断

していた。黒人女性たちは黒人YWCA支部の理事会のメンバーであり、また地元の都市のYWCA理事会のメンバーでもあったが、YWCA全国理事会には黒人メンバーは不在であった。さらに、クリーヴランド大会に出席していたアフリカ系アメリカ人女性たちは大会の祝宴からも排除されていた。彼女たちの夕食は地元の（白人）YWCAで振る舞われた。

黒人女性たちは河井の「より良い国際理解のための嘆願」を、世界平和は国内の人種間理解から始まるという考えにそって解釈した。黒人女性たちにとっては、人種間理解を解釈するために用いた宗教的レンズは受難をめぐるものであったが、白人女性たちにとってはこのレンズは罪に結びついていて、河井の大会でのメッセージは、白人と黒人にとって「人種」を通して異なる屈折をみせた「協調の言語」を通じて広まった。ロバートソンは、アメリカYWCAでの人種にそった区分は、しばしば個人的な性格のものに関する個人的な誤解とみなされ、それゆえに教育によって修正可能な問題と捉えられているが、しかし実際にはそれらの区分は深く構造に根差すものだと結論付ける。ロバートソンの分析は、トランスナショナルな関与の仕方を決めるにあたって、またトランスナショナルなメッセージの受容のされ方を決めるうえで、構造的な問題が持つ影響力を指摘している。

河井はロンドンのIFUW会議の出席者の女性たちに、[日本では]その年の国会に女性の高等教育施設を求める嘆願書が、何百人もの女性たちに署名され、提出されたことと、1919年に全国大学協会（National College Association）が結成されたことを伝えた。河井はまた、学生キリスト教連盟（Student Christian Federation）の国際的な性格についても話し、二つの組織が協力して、より良い、より全き生活を世界の女性たちに実現させる手助けとなるという希望を語った¹⁰²⁾。

翌1922年のIFUW会議で、IFUW会長キャロライン・スパージョンは、日本人女性のIFUWへの関心と彼女たちの日本での活動について述べた¹⁰³⁾。1922年のIFUW会議で、東京女子大学卒業生のフジサワ夫人が日本大学女性連盟を代表した¹⁰⁴⁾。フジサワ夫人は会議で、日本での民主化の進展について話し、それによって女性たちが特に教育などの分野で、それまで知り得なかった権利を享受していると述べた。彼女は以下のように語った。

日本の教育コースは、6年の初等教育、5年の中等教育、そして5年の大学教育からなる。女子大学があり、哲学、人文学、科学、医学を教える。日本大学女性連盟（Federation of Japanese University Women）は、それゆえ、他の連盟と同等の条件でIFUWに加入する権利がある¹⁰⁵⁾。

1924年のクリスチانياでの第3回 IFUW 会議では、しかし、日本についての言及はなかった。1929年のジュネーヴ会議で、アメリカのミス・ユーイング (Miss Ewing) は、IFUW は中国と日本の女性たちを包摂するまでは不完全であると述べた。しかし、日本の連盟の IFUW への加盟は第二次世界大戦後まで実現しなかった。これは単に政治の問題ではなく、また日本との地理的な距離感の問題でもなかった。ギルダスリーヴのミス・ユーイングへの返答は、IFUW メンバーシップを決定した構造が障壁となったことを示す。

IFUW は、ジーマーマンが定義するところの国際化による国民化 (nationalisation) の過程を描き出す。この過程では、国際協会に参加するために、新しい国民協会や国民連盟が形成される¹⁰⁶⁾。IFUW 規約は「国民連盟」の定義は、人種排他的な協会ではないと規定する。その意図は、同じ地理的範囲に住むすべての大学人女性たちを各々が住む国を代表する一つの連盟に結束させることだった。これにより、エスニシティの多様な連盟が産まれた。アメリカの大学を卒業してイギリス在住である人は、例えば、アメリカ大学卒業生協会 (American Association of Collegiate Alumnae, AAUW の一部) と BFUW のメンバーとなる資格があった¹⁰⁷⁾。アメリカ大学女性協会 (American Association of University Women, 以下 AAUW) のクレア・ルーミス (Clare Loomis) は中国と日本を旅行し、1922年の IFUW 会議では、日本でひとつの協会が結成され、イギリス人とアメリカ人、そして海外で学んだ日本人女性たちを結びつける素晴らしい働きをしていると報告した。ルーミスは、近い将来、真に国民的な組織の問題が前面に出てくだろうと考えた¹⁰⁸⁾。ギルダスリーヴの返答は、問題は「真に国民的な」という意味の定義にあったことを示す。東京支部は AAUW の分派であり、これは IFUW が国民的組織と考えるものでなかった。IFUW のメンバーシップ規約は、国民国家の領土的な考えに基づいていた¹⁰⁹⁾。ギルダスリーヴは 1929 年会議で、日本での AAUW 支部は業務の一環として「真の」日本協会を立ち上げるよう指導されたと述べた¹¹⁰⁾。IFUW の構造的問題は、ギルダスリーヴのような女性たちの母性主義的な態度とあいまって、日本人女性のエージェンシーを看過していた。

反対に、地域的にトランスローカルな構造は、一方で国民的な、他方で超国民的なものを求めており、女性のトランスナショナルな可視性を助けた。河井がアジアの地域的な副会長に選出されたことは、河井が写真の中で歓迎されたことを意味するが、それは IAW の記述の中を糸のように貫くオリエンタリストな色合いによってではなかった。また、ギルダスリーヴの母性主義的なアプローチによってでもなかった。河井はアジア地域の代表と

して、一方では国民的なレベルで日本を、他方ではトランスナショナルな領域で世界 YWCA を結び付ける存在として見ることができる。ここでは河井は、世界 YWCA が「国民という布の中に織り込まれている」とみなした協力の糸と、「完成された世界の型紙の調和と力」のよりどころとなる糸の中のなかにあつて、独自の権利を持った活動者であるのだ¹¹¹⁾。

結論

結論からすると、教育をめぐる女性たちの対話は、帝國的な空間の合間で、そしてそれを横断して繋がる。彼女たちの教育に関する会話は、女性たちのネットワークがトランスナショナルな繋がりや教育に新しい空間を創り上げるにつれ、交錯し、循環する。女性の科学的・文化的国際主義への参加は、それを通じて女性の活動が国際的構造の中で可視化されるチャンネルや手段を形成する。この国際的構造はトランスナショナルな領域での彼女たちの活動を促進すると同時に抑制もする。

ジェンダーと教育の歴史家は急速にトランスナショナルな循環と連環についての問いを立ててきている。しかし、ロジャースが最近取り上げたように、入江昭・ソーニエ編『パルグレイヴ・トランスナショナル史辞典 (*Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History*)』には教育や学校を扱った項目はない¹¹²⁾。同様に、入江の『グローバル・ヒストリーとトランスナショナル・ヒストリー (*Global and Transnational History*)』¹¹³⁾とソーニエの『トランスナショナル・ヒストリー (*Transnational History*)』¹¹⁴⁾にも教育と学校への言及はない。しかし、多くの国の報告書は、教育が女性の地域的・国家的・国際的・トランスナショナルなレベルでの参加の重要な場であったことを示す。歴史家たちがジェンダーと女子教育を研究するにつれて、彼(女)らにはトランスナショナル・ヒストリーの領域において、女性教育史を認知させるための取り組みもまた必要となっている。

註

- 1) Fuchs [2014], p.13.
- 2) Massey [2005], p.6.
- 3) Yamasaki [2015a], [2015b].
- 4) Fuchs [2014], pp.11-26.
- 5) Fuchs [2014], p.19.
- 6) Berkovitch [1999], pp.4-5.
- 7) Mazlish& Iriye [2005], p.11.
- 8) Mazlish [1998].
- 9) Caruso [2008].
- 10) Fuchs [2014], p.17.
- 11) Caruso [2008], pp. 839-840.
- 12) Hirst& Bromley [1996], pp.16-19; Akami [2002], p.9.
- 13) Vertovec [1999], p.447.
- 14) Grant, Levine& Trentmann [2005], p.4.
- 15) Clavin [2005].
- 16) ティーンエージャー向け小説の例を参照のこと。 Rossosof& Spencer
[<https://teenfictionsproject.wordpress.com/>].
- 17) Fuchs [2014], p.15.
- 18) Carlier [2010].
- 19) Fuchs [2014], p.15.
- 20) Vertovec [1999], pp. 447-462.
- 21) Fuchs [2014], p.15.
- 22) Paisley [2009].
- 23) Akami [2002].
- 24) Grant, Levine& Trentmann [2005], pp.1-15.
- 25) Goodman [2002], pp.179-98.
- 26) Tamboukou [2003], pp.67-73.
- 27) Whitehead [2005].
- 28) Goodman [2012]; Pietsch [2010].
- 29) Hall [2002a], Hall [2002b], Hall& Rose [2006a].
- 30) Rosenberg [2012].
- 31) Lambert& Lester [2006]; Pietsch [2015]; Goodman, Jacobs, Kisby& Loader [2011].
- 32) Goodman, McCulloch& Richardson [2009], p.296; Mackenzie [1999]; Colley [2002]; Mangan [1988];
「帝国」と「帝国主義」については、 Hall& Rose [2006b]を参照のこと。また、「植民
(colonization)」については、 Hall [2000], p.5を参照のこと。
- 33) Chakrabarty [2000], p.8; Chakrabarty [2002], p.82: For the universal acts as a placeholder for
historical particularity see Chakrabarty [2002], p.105.
- 34) Popkewitz [2010], p.24; Fabian [1983], p.2, 6, 13 15, 147.
- 35) Ohkura& Shibata [2010].
- 36) Paisley [2009], p.6.
- 37) Takahashi [2013].
- 38) 'Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks', *The College News*, 14 December 1921.
- 39) Paisley [2009], p.6.
- 40) Sandell [2015], pp.156-157.
- 41) Yasutake [2011].
- 42) Hinder [1928].
- 43) Azuma [2003], [2005].
- 44) Sobe [2013].
- 45) Werner& Zimmermann [2006], p.38.
- 46) Werner& Zimmermann [2006], p.38.
- 47) Werner& Zimmermann [2006], p.38.
- 48) Verbruggen& Carlier [2009].
- 49) Tröhler [2012].
- 50) Iriye [1997], p.60.
- 51) Trentmann [2005].
- 52) Burkman [2008], p.149.
- 53) Trentmann [2005], p.43.

- 54) Rosselló [1944], p.60.
- 55) Morefield [2005].
- 56) ICIC [1930], pp.23-24, 27.
- 57) Akami [2002], p.9.
- 58) Butler [1913].
- 59) Zimmern [1936], p. 5.
- 60) Zimmern [1932], pp.4-5.
- 61) Zimmern [1914], p.17
- 62) Gildersleeve [n.d.].
- 63) Zimmern [1932], p.1.
- 64) Von Oertzen [2014], p.vii.
- 65) IFUW [1920a], p.3, 10. 第一回ロンドン大会の代表団は、アメリカ、フランス、イタリア、スペイン、ベルギー、オランダ、デンマーク、ノルウェイ、スウェーデン、チェコスロバキア、インド、カナダ、オーストラリア、南アフリカから派遣された。
- 66) Bosanquet [1929], p.51.
- 67) SDN [1934], p.4, 18, 19.
- 68) Bonnet [1932].
- 69) この立場は、国家の権力や国益の問題を看過している。Frits [2005], pp.142-4.
- 70) 「いわゆる独立した専門家 (so-called independent experts)」という呼び方は、Clavin and Wesselsによる。彼れらは、国際連盟の経済・金融組織の文脈において、理事会 (the Council) に常任席を有する国民国家のメンバーの意向を反映していると論じている。Clavin& Wessels [2005], p.472.
- 71) Bosanquet [1929], p.54.
- 72) Von Oertzen [2014], pp.44, 46.
- 73) IFUW [1928a]: IFUW [1928b], pp.95-96.
- 74) SDN [1926].
- 75) Von Oertzen [2014], p.41.
- 76) 敏待の場を提供するものとして、レマン湖を臨むニトベの家についての類似の記述については、Burkman [2008], pp.153-157 を参照のこと。
- 77) Von Oertzen [2014], pp.42,-43.
- 78) Spencer [n.d.].
- 79) 'Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks'()
- 80) 彼らは 1894 年に結婚し、1921 年に離婚しているが、この期間のかなりの間不仲であった。
- 81) Deacon, Russell& Woollacott [2010], pp.1-11.
- 82) Saunier [2013], p.57.
- 83) Sobe [2008], p.68.
- 84) Massey [2005].
- 85) Schiller, Darieva& Gruner-Domic [2011], pp.402-403.
- 86) Schiller, Darieva& Gruner-Domic [2011], p. 403.
- 87) Sandell [2015], p.122.
- 88) フランス語やドイツ語での報告が何本かあった。
- 89) Sandell [2015].
- 90) Sandell [2014], p.22.
- 91) Kawai [1940], pp.137-147.
- 92) Kawai [1940], p.148.
- 93) WYWCA [1920], p.4.
- 94) Kawai [1940], p.148.
- 95) Sandell [2015], p.124.
- 96) Kawai [1940], p.148. ナイドゥはガンジーと密接な関係にあった。ナイドゥの文筆活動、国民運動については、Brinks [2013]を参照のこと。
- 97) Paisley [2009].
- 98) Sandell [2011], p.172.
- 99) Kawai [1940], p.148.
- 100) このパラグラフと次のパラグラフは、大部分、Robertson [2007], chapter 4.による。
- 101) YWCA [1920b], p.122 quoted in Robertson [2007], pp.210-211.

- 102) IFUW [1920b], p.54.
 103) Spurgeon [1922], p.18. IFUW [1922a], pp. 11-14 この部分は,p.18.
 104) IFUW [1922a], pp. 11-14. この部分は p.14.
 105) IFUW [1922b], p.30.
 106) Zimmerman [2005], p.87.
 107) IFUW [1920a], p.77.
 108) IFUW [1922c], pp.33-34.
 109) この点は、Hirst, Thompson& Bromley [1996], pp.16-19 の国際主義の分析と一致する。 .
 110) IFUW [1929], p.69.
 111) YWCA [1920a], final page.
 112) Iriye& Saunier [2009].
 113) Iriye [2013].
 114) Saunier [2013].

Bibliography

- Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks. *The College News*, 14 December 1921.
 AKAMI, T. 2002. *Internationalizing the Pacific: the United States, Japan and the Institute of Pacific Relations in War and Peace, 1919-45*, London, Routledge.
 AZUMA, E. 2003. "The Pacific Era Has Arrived": Transnational Education among Japanese Americans, 1932-1941. *History of Education Quarterly*, 43, 39-73.
 AZUMA, E. 2005. *Between Two Empires : Race, History, and Transnationalism in Japanese America*, Oxford New York, Oxford University Press.
 BERKOVITCH, N. 1999. *From Motherhood to Citizenship*, Baltimore, John Hopkins University Press.
 BONNET, H. 1932. Recent Developments in International Intellectual Co-operation. *Information Bulletin*, 1, 5.
 BOSANQUET, T. 1929. The Aims and Record of the International Federation. *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*. London: IFUW.
 BRINKS, P. E. 2013. *Anglophone Indian Women Writers, 1870-1920*, Ashgate Publishing Limited.
 BURKMAN, T. W. 2008. *Japan and the League of Nations: Empire and World Order, 1914-1938*, Honolulu, T.H., University of Hawai'i Press.
 BUTLER, N. M. 1913. *The International Mind: An Argument for the Judicial Settlement of International Disputes*, New York, Shares Scribner's Sons.
 CARLIER, J. 2010. Forgotten Transnational Connections and National Contexts: an "Entangled History" of the Political Transfers that Shaped Belgian Feminism, 1890-1914. *Women's History Review*, 19, 502-533.
 CARUSO, M. 2008. World Systems, World Society, World Polity: theoretical insights for a global history of education. *History of Education*, 37, 825-840.
 CHAKRABARTY, D. 2000. *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference*, Princeton, N.J., Princeton University Press.
 CHAKRABARTY, D. 2002. Universalism and Belonging in the Logic of Capital. In: BRECKENRIDGE, C. A., POLLOCK, S. I., BHABHA, H. K. & CHAKRABARTY, D. (eds.) *Cosmopolitanism*. Durham: Duke University Press, 82-110.
 CLAVIN, P. 2005. Defining Transnationalism. *Contemporary European History*, 14, 421-39.
 CLAVIN, P. & WESSELS, J.-W. 2005. Transnationalism and the League of Nations: Understanding the Work of its Economic and Financial Organisation. *Contemporary European History*, 14, 465-492.
 COLLEY, L. 2002. *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World 1600-1850*, London, Jonathan Cape.
 CUNNINGHAM, P. 2015. Educational pioneering and cultural exchange: the case of Elizabeth Hughes (1851-1925). ISCHE 37 Istanbul.
 DEACON, L., RUSSELL, P. & WOOLLACOTT, A. 2010. Introduction. In: DEACON, L., RUSSELL, P. & WOOLLACOTT, A. (eds.) *Transnational Lives: Biographies of Colonial Modernity 1700-Present*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 1-11.
 FABIAN, J. 1983. *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*, New York, Columbia University Press.
 FRITZ, J.-S. 2005. Internationalism and the Promise of Science. In: LONG, D. & SCHMIDT, B. C. (eds.) *Imperialism and Internationalism in the Discipline of International Relations*. Albany: SUNY, 141-158.
 FUCHS, E. 2014. History of Education Beyond the Nation? Trends in Historical and Educational

- Scholarship. In: BAGCHI, B., FUCHS, E. & ROUSMANIERE, K. (eds.) *Connecting Histories of Education: Transnational and Cross-cultural Exchanges in (Post-)colonial Education*. New York: Berghahn Books.
- GILDERSLEEVE, V. C. nd. The Creation of the International Mind. *Gildersleeve Collection*. Mss: Columbia University.
- GOODMAN, J. 2002. 'Their Market Value Must be Greater for the Experience They Had Gained': Secondary School Headmistresses and Empire 1897-1914. In: GOODMAN, J. & MARTIN, J. (eds.) *Gender, Colonialism and Education: The Politics of Experience*. London: Woburn Press.
- GOODMAN, J. 2012. Transatlantic Crossings and Professional Lives: Ellen Knox's Travel Between Canada and England. *History of Education Researcher*, 89, 36-44.
- GOODMAN, J., JACOBS, A., KISBY, F. & LOADER, H. 2011. Travelling careers: overseas migration patterns in the professional lives of women attending Girton and Newnham before 1939. *History of Education*, 40, 179-196.
- GOODMAN, J., MCCULLOCH, G. & RICHARDSON, W. 2009. "Empires Overseas" and "Empires at Home": Postcolonial and Transnational Perspectives on Social Change in the History of Education. *Paedagogica Historica*, 45, 695-706.
- GRANT, K., LEVINE, P. & TRENTMANN, F. 2005. Introduction. In: GRANT, K., LEVINE, P. & TRENTMANN, F. (eds.) *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism c1880-1950*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.
- HALL, C. 2000. Introduction: Thinking the Postcolonial, Thinking the Empire. In: HALL, C. (ed.) *Cultures of Empire: Colonizers in Britain and the Empire in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: a Reader*. London: Routledge, 1-36.
- HALL, C. 2002a. *Civilising Subjects: Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination, 1830-1867*, Oxford, Polity.
- HALL, C. 2002b. Histories, empire and the post-colonial question. In: CHAMBERS, I. & CURTI, L. (eds.) *The Postcolonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*. London: Routledge, 65-77.
- HALL, C. & ROSE, S. O. (eds.) 2006a. *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- HALL, C. & ROSE, S. O. 2006b. Introduction: Being at Home with the Empire. In: HALL, C. & ROSE, S. O. (eds.) *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1-31.
- HINDER, E. 1928. The Outcome of the First Pan Pacific Women's Conference, Honolulu August 9-19 1928. *Mid Pacific Magazine*, 407-10.
- HIRST, P., THOMPSON, G. & BROMLEY, S. 1996. *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance*, Cambridge, Polity Press.
- ICIC 1930. Minutes of the Twelfth Session. Held at Geneva from Wednesday, July 23rd, to Tuesday, July 29th, 1930, 13 August 1930 [C.428.M.192.1930.X11 [C.I.C.I./12th Session/P.V.]].
- IFUW 1920a. *Report of the First Conference, July, 1920*.
- IFUW 1920b. Japan. *Report of the First Conference, July, 1920*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1920c. Notes on the Constitution and Bye Laws. *Report of the First Conference, 1920*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1922a. List of Delegates. IFUW, *Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1922b. The University Women of Japan. *Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1922c. University Women of the East. *Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1928a. Committee on Intellectual Co-operation. *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1928b. Resolution - Intellectual Co-operation. *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW.
- IFUW 1929. Summary of Dr. von Zahn Harnack's Speech. *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*. London: IFUW, 60-69.
- IRIYE, A. 1997. *Cultural Internationalism and World Order*, Baltimore, Md.; London, Johns Hopkins University Press.
- IRIYE, A. 2013. *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future*, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan.
- IRIYE, A. & SAUNIER, P.-Y. 2009. *The Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History: From the Mid-19th Century to the Present*, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan.
- KAWAI, M. 1940. *My Lantern*, Tokyo, Kyobunkwan.

- LAMBERT, D. & LESTER, A. 2006. *Colonial Lives Across the British Empire: Imperial Careering in the Long Nineteenth Century*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- MACKENZIE, J. 1999. *Empire and Metropolitan Cultures*. In: PORTER, A. (ed.) *The Oxford History of the British Empire: Volume III: The Nineteenth Century*. Oxford: OUP, 212-31.
- MANGAN, J. A. (ed.) 1988. *Benefits Bestowed?: Education and British Imperialism*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- MASSEY, D. B. 2005. *For Space*, London, Sage.
- MAZLISH, B. 1998. Comparing Global History to World History. *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 28, 385-395.
- MAZLISH, B. & IRIYE, A. 2005. *The Global History Reader*, London, Routledge.
- MOREFIELD, J. 2005. *Covenants Without Swords: Idealist Liberalism and the Spirit of Empire*, Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- OHKURA, K. & SHIBATA, M. 2010. Globalization and Education in Japan. In: POPKEWITZ, T. S. & RIZVI, F. (eds.) *Globalization and the Study of Education*. Malden Mass.: Blackwell, 160-179.
- PAISLEY, F. 2009. *Glamour in the Pacific: Cultural Internationalism and Race Politics in the Women's Pan-Pacific*, Honolulu, University of Hawai Press.
- PIETSCH, T. 2010. A British Sea: Making Sense of Global Space in the Late Nineteenth Century. *Journal of Global History*, 5, 423-446.
- PIETSCH, T. 2015. *Empire of Scholars: Universities, Networks and the British Academic World, 1850-1939*, Manchester, Manchester University Press.
- POPKEWITZ, T. 2010. Comparative Studies and Unthinking Comparative "Thought": The Paradox of "Reason" and its Abjections. In: M.LARSEN (ed.) *New Thinking in Comparative Education: Honouring Robert Cowen*. London: Sense Publishers, 15-28.
- ROBERTSON, N. M. 2007. *Christian Sisterhood, Race Relations, and the YWCA, 1906-46*, Urbana, University of Illinois Press.
- ROSENBERG, E. S. 2012. *A World Connecting: 1870-1945*, Cambridge, Mass.; London, Harvard University Press.
- ROSSELLÓ, P. 1944. *Forerunners of the International Bureau of Education: A Hitherto Unrecorded Aspect of the History of Education and of International Institutions*, London, Evans Brothers Ltd.
- ROSSOFF, N. & SPENCER, S. *Transnational Femininities: Fictions for Teenage Girls in the UK and US, 1910-1965*
[Online]. <https://teenfictionsproject.wordpress.com/>.
- SANDELL, M. 2011. 'A Real Meeting of the Women of the East and West': Women and Internationalism in the Interwar Period. In: LAQUA, D. (ed.) *Internationalism Reconfigured: Transnational Ideas and Movements Between the World Wars*. New York: I. B. Tauris & Co. Ltd, 161-186.
- SANDELL, M. 2014. Learning in and from the West: International Students and International Women's Organisations in the Interwar Period. *History of Education*, 44, 5-24.
- SANDELL, M. 2015. *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood Between the World Wars*, London, I. B. Tauris.
- SAUNIER, P.-Y. 2013. *Transnational History*, London, Routledge.
- SCHILLER, N. G., DARIEVA, T. & GRUNER-DOMIC, S. 2011. Defining Cosmopolitan Sociability in a Transnational Age. An Introduction. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 34, 399-418.
- SDN Meeting of Representatives of International Student Organisations, Minutes of the Fourth Meeting held on April 9 1926, SDN Archive Geneva, ICIC Box r1017.: SDN.
- SDN 1934. *International Intellectual Co-operation 1933*, Paris, International Institute of Intellectual Co-operation.
- SOBE, N. W. 2008. *Provincializing the Worldly Citizen: Yugoslav Student and Teacher Travel and Slavic Cosmopolitanism in the Interwar Era*, Peter Lang.
- SOBE, N. W. 2013. Entanglement and Transnationalism in the History of American Education. In: POPKEWITZ, T. S. (ed.) *Rethinking the History of Education: Transnational Perspectives on Its Questions, Methods, and Knowledge*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 93-107.
- SPENCER, S. Cosmopolitan sociability within the British and International Federations of University Women (1950-1965). Unpublished paper, ANZHES conference.
- SPURGEON, C. 1922. The Growth of the International Federation. *IFUW, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW, 18-19.
- TAKAHASHI, Y. 2013. Recent Collaborative Endeavors by Historians of Women and Gender in Japan. *Journal of Women's History*, 25, 244-254.
- TAMBOUKOU, M. 2003. *Women, Education and the Self: A Foucauldian Perspective*, Basingstoke,

- Palgrave.
- TRENTMANN, F. 2005. After the Nation-State: Citizenship, Empire and Global Coordination in the New Internationalism, 1914-1930. In: GRANT, K., LEVINE, P. & TRENTMANN, F. (eds.) *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism c.1880-1950*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 34-53.
- TRÖHLER, D. 2012. *Languages of Education: Protestant Legacies, National Identities, and Global Aspirations*, London, Routledge.
- VERBRUGGEN, C. & CARLIER, J. 2009. An entangled history of ideas and ideals: feminism, social and educational reform in children's libraries in Belgium before the First World War. *Paedagogica Historica*, 45, 291-308.
- VERTOVEC, S. 1999. Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22, 447-462.
- VON OERTZEN, C. 2014. *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*, London, Palgrave Macmillan.
- WERNER, M. & ZIMMERMANN, B. 2006. Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity. *History and Theory*, 45, 30-50.
- WHITEHEAD, K. 2005. Vocation, Career and Character in Early Twentieth-century Women Teachers' Work in City Schools. *History of Education*, 34, 579-597.
- YWCA 1920. Minutes of the Meetings of the World's Young Women's Christian Association Committee, Champéry, June 11-14, 1920.
- YAMASAKI, Y. 2015a. Educational Tourism and its Impacts: Intercultural Interaction Between Japan and the West at the Turn of the 19th to the 20th Century (Panel). ISCHE 37 Istanbul.
- YAMASAKI, Y. 2015b. Yasui Tetsu (1870-1945) and transcultural influences in educational reforms for women. ISCHE 37 Istanbul.
- YASUTAKE, R. 2011. The Rise of Women's Internationalism in the Countries of the Asia-Pacific Region During the Interwar Years, From a Japanese Perspective. *Women's History Review*, 20, 521-532.
- YWCA 1920a. *How Wide is Your Circle*, New York, YWCA.
- YWCA 1920b. National Young Women's Christian Association, Proceedings of the Sixth National Convention Cleveland, Ohio, April 13-20, 1920.
- ZIMMERMAN, S. 2005. The Challenge of Multinational Empire for the International Women's Movement: The Habsburg Monarchy and the Development of Feminist Inter/National Politics. *Journal of Women's History*, 17, 87-117.
- ZIMMERN, A. E. 1914. Introductory. In: GREENWOOD, A., SETON-WATSON, R. W., WILSON, J. D. & ZIMMERN, A. E. (eds.) *The War and Democracy*. London, 1-17.
- ZIMMERN, A. E. 1932. The Development of the International Mind. In: ZIMMERN, A. E. (ed.) *Problems of Peace: Lectures delivered at the Geneva Inst. of International Relations*. Geneva: Institute of International Relations, 1-27.
- ZIMMERN, A. E. 1936. *The League of Nations and the Rule of Law: 1918 - 1935*, London, Macmillan.

Centre for the History of Women's Education, University of Winchester

Fuchs highlights gender studies of education and schooling as one of the main areas of transnational scholarship in the field of history of education. He says that the focus in gender studies of education and schooling on transfer and exchange relations and mutual influences has led to a focus on new actors and new spaces.¹ The new spaces, to which Fuchs refers, are both geographical and metaphorical. They stretch from what Massey calls the 'immensity of the global to the intimately tiny.'² Women have often been excluded from authority in the

¹ Eckhardt Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation? Trends in Historical and Educational Scholarship," in *Connecting Histories of Education: Transnational and Cross-Cultural Exchanges in (Post-)Colonial Education*, ed. Barnita Bagchi, Eckhardt Fuchs, and Kate Rousmaniere (New York: Berghahn Books, 2014). pp.11-26 here p.13

² Doreen B. Massey, *For Space* (London: Sage, 2005). p.6

nation state and so from national historiographies; but they become visible as agentic subjects in spaces and flows across national borders, as they create educational spaces, and develop ideas about education. Tracking the movements of historical actors and of educational ideas across borders is proving a fruitful avenue for historians of gender and education. The panel that Yamasaki organised at the 2015 ISCHE conference, for example, illustrates that transnational approaches are producing fascinating multi-sited research on intercultural interaction between Japan and the West.³

Having lived outside England for a number of years, I became interested in women who crossed borders. I was drawn initially to research women teachers and headteachers who negotiated British imperial spaces. I then looked at the intersection of histories of imperialism and histories of internationalism in places like the League of Nations and in organisations like the International Federation of University Women (IFUW). These organisations enabled women to pursue personal, intellectual and political goals, and to develop ideas in transnational networks about the education of women and girls. My more recent transnational research focusses on women's place in histories of comparative education and on ways in which women have used comparison in order to connect.

The presentation is in four sections. First, different approaches to histories beyond the nation; second, transnational approaches and new imperial histories; third, entangled histories and languages of co-operation. Lastly, transnational engagements and national and regional structures. I will start by briefly outlining different approaches to histories beyond the nation that are variously termed global history, world history, transnational history and translocal history.

Histories beyond the nation

Fuchs notes that global history raises questions of transnational and global governance, territoriality and sovereignty beyond, or as an extension of, the nation state.⁴ He discusses world system theory, which refers to the processes of convergence of the global cultural order. Fuchs identifies a number of characteristics of world systems theory: universalism,

³ Yoko Yamasaki, "Educational Tourism and Its Impacts: Intercultural Interaction between Japan and the West at the Turn of the 19th to the 20th Century (Panel)," (ISCHE 37 Istanbul2015). Papers on women educationists included "Yasui Tetsu (1870-1945) and Transcultural Influences in Educational Reforms for Women " (ISCHE 37 Istanbul2015). And Peter Cunningham, "Educational Pioneering and Cultural Exchange: The Case of Elizabeth Hughes (1851-1925)," (ISCHE 37 Istanbul2015).

⁴ Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation?." pp.11-26.

individualism, a belief in progress, purposeful rationality, self-organized action, and world citizenship.⁵ Berkovitch illustrates a world systems perspective on women's rights and global discourse. She discusses an emerging world social agenda around improving the lot of womanhood. She looks at interwar discourses for the protection of women and children. She argues that a world systems approach overcomes the tendency in studies of individual countries or when comparing countries to see them as exceptional, which she says masks similarities among them. Instead, Berkovitch sees different trends as different manifestations of the same process, which she argues results from the global context. For Berkovitch the global context is a major determinant of states' structure and actions in general and of women's issues in particular.⁶

Mazlish and Iriye see scholars of world history taking the whole of past history as their subject,⁷ but historians of globalisation taking each of the factors of globalization as a focus of study.⁸ Fuchs, however, notes that the terms world history and global history are often used interchangeably. Caruso outlines theoretical insights for a global history of education from theories of world systems, world society and world polity. Like Berkovitch he argues that these approaches deliver fruitful insights into 'the emergence, spread and varying institutionalisation of a transnational educational field, presenting grand narratives of modernisation, change and expansion.'⁹ Critiques of world systems approaches point to its hierarchical, top down approach and its Eurocentrically defined world society.¹⁰ In response Caruso argues that in its more sophisticated conceptions, the category of globalisation is not a one-way process but 'opens up a space of conflicting narratives and struggling forces'. He concludes that taking account of the work of global forces and the specific causation of a global level does not necessarily mean returning to a history closely related to concepts or unity. He argues that the challenge for historians of global history is to show the effects of another level of causation in tension with local, regional and national factors.¹¹ Hirst, Thompson and Bromley distinguish globalization from internationalization. They understand internationalization in terms of promotions by institutions based on notions of the nation state. But they see globalization as phenomena or activities based on transnational organisations.¹²

⁵ Ibid. pp 11-26 here p.19.

⁶ Nitza Berkovitch, *From Motherhood to Citizenship* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1999). pp.4, 5.

⁷ Bruce Mazlish and Akira Iriye, *The Global History Reader* (London: Routledge, 2005).p.11.

⁸ Bruce Mazlish, "Comparing Global History to World History," *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 28, no. 3 (1998).

⁹ Marcelo Caruso, "World Systems, World Society, World Polity: Theoretical Insights for a Global History of Education," *History of Education* 37, no. 6 (2008).

¹⁰ Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation?." pp.11-26, here 17.

¹¹ Caruso, "World Systems." here pp. 839-40.

¹² Paul Hirst, Grahame Thompson, and Simon Bromley, *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1996). pp.16-19. See discussion

Vertovec defines transnationalism as the multiple ties and interactions that link people or institutions across the borders and boundaries of nation states.¹³ These interactions form multi-layered networks of practices, loyalties, institutions and traditions.¹⁴ Geyer identifies three aspects to transnational histories. First, a focus on non-state actors and spaces that are in a state of constant change and do not fall into national categories. This focus on non-state actors and redefined spaces is clearly useful in retrieving the history of women's education. It also widens the scope of archival sources in constructing narratives about women, girls and their formal and informal education.¹⁵ Second, Geyer argues that transnational history can operate as an extension of national history.¹⁶ Again, this has been useful in writing back the activities of women into national history.¹⁷ Third, Geyer identifies transnational history as an examination of the development of the nation state as a global phenomenon.¹⁸ Like Vertovec, Grant, Levine and Trentman also see transnationalism in terms of reconstructions of place, which they term translocal understandings.¹⁹

Translocal history seeks to use transnationalism for area studies. Fuchs notes that translocal history aims to describe relationships between local spaces and the establishment and institutionalization of cultural, social and political structures and orders.²⁰ Both Paisley's work on the Pan-Pacific women's organisations²¹ and Akami's work on internationalising the Pacific illustrate that translocal approaches can be linked with transnational perspectives in fruitful ways.²²

In the following section I discuss transnationalism and the imperial 'turn'.

in Tomoko Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific: The United States, Japan and the Institute of Pacific Relations in War and Peace, 1919-45* (London: Routledge, 2002).p.9.

¹³ Vertovec, *Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism*, *Ethnic and Racial Studies* XX11 (2) March 1999, 447 Steven Vertovec, "Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22, no. 2 (1999). Patricia Clavin, "Defining Transnationalism," *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 2 (2005).

¹⁴ Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine, and Frank Trentmann, "Introduction," ed. Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine, and Frank Trentmann, *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism c1880-1950* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005). pp.1-15, here p.4.

¹⁵ See for example the Teenfiction Project: Nancy Rossoff and Stephanie Spencer, "Transnational Femininities: Fictions for Teenage Girls in the UK and US, 1910-1965."

¹⁶ Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation?." pp.11-26, here p.15.

¹⁷ Julie Carlier, "Forgotten Transnational Connections and National Contexts: An "Entangled History" of the Political Transfers That Shaped Belgian Feminism, 1890-1914," *Women's History Review* 19, no. 4 (2010).

¹⁸ Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation?." pp.11-26, here 15.

¹⁹ Vertovec, *Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism*, *Ethnic and Racial Studies* XX11 (2) March 1999, 447. Vertovec, "Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism."

²⁰ Fuchs, "History of Education Beyond the Nation?." pp.11-26 here p.15.

²¹ Fiona Paisley, *Glamour in the Pacific: Cultural Internationalism and Race Politics in the Women's Pan-Pacific* (Honolulu: University of Hawai Press, 2009).

²² Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific*.

Transnationalism and the imperial turn

Grant, Levine and Trentmann see the seeds of transnationalism as imperial. They argue that empires were critical sites where transnational, social, and cultural movements took place.²³ The seeds of my interest in transnational perspectives on the history of women's education grew from the flows and movements of women teachers in and around the British empire.²⁴ Teachers are a particularly fruitful group of women for transnational research. Literature on travel points to the privileged status of the traveller, as a 'woman of independent means'. But as Tamboukou points out, women teacher travellers do not quite fit into this category. In the interwar period, travelling women teachers from England were likely to be unmarried due to the requirement for women teachers to resign on marriage. But travelling teachers from England included educated working women who could not depend on family income to support their travel. As Tamboukou notes, teachers' journeys were not generally those of the romantic traveller who wandered at will. Teachers' travel was 'orderly and purposeful' and often undertaken to further their education or work. Nonetheless, travel afforded women teachers the experience of being different in 'different worlds', both real and imagined.²⁵

Ellen Knox travelled many times between England and Canada and illustrates Tamboukou's points. She trained and worked as a teacher under Dorothea Beale at Cheltenham Ladies College in England and travelled to Toronto as founding principal of Havergal College. Her story highlights empire as a site where teachers' professional identities were shaped in ways that melded aspects of 'home' and 'away'. Knox spent the first thirty-five years of her life in England and the second thirty in Canada. In her identity definitions of Canada were derived from Britain but were lived out in Canada and mingled with other influences. For women like Knox, mobility highlights aspects of Western discourses of vocation, career and character that framed professional identities for women teachers from the early twentieth century.²⁶ Knox's story also points to the importance of the spaces of travel between empire and colony and of the process of travel itself for the reworking of teachers' professional identities. Sometimes Knox travelled alone, sometimes with a teacher from Havergal College. Sometimes she travelled back to Canada in the company of the teachers from England she had recruited to teach at Havergal. In the spaces of movement across borders ships provided opportunities for

²³ Grant, Levine, and Trentmann, "Introduction." pp.1-15.

²⁴ Joyce Goodman, "'Their Market Value Must Be Greater for the Experience They Had Gained': Secondary School Headmistresses and Empire 1897-1914," in *Gender, Colonialism and Education: The Politics of Experience*, ed. Joyce Goodman and Jane Martin (London: Woburn Press, 2002). pp.179-98.

²⁵ Maria Tamboukou, *Women, Education and the Self: A Foucauldian Perspective* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2003). pp.67-73.

²⁶ Kay Whitehead, "Vocation, Career and Character in Early Twentieth-Century Women Teachers' Work in City Schools," *History of Education* 34, no. 6 (2005).

conversation and the reworking of teacher identities as teachers travelled in the routes of trade and empire.²⁷

The idea that professional relations for women in England could be inflected by relations of imperialism overseas resonated with what came to be called the 'imperial turn'.²⁸ Imperial history developed scholarship that demonstrated the interdependence and interconnectedness of political and social change across the world.²⁹ From the viewpoint of the 'imperial turn' empire was seen as a web of relations in which educational careers were formed as teachers and others moved in, across and between empires.³⁰

New imperial histories turned away from the uni-directional flows from 'centre' to 'periphery' that had informed earlier studies of education and empire.³¹ A range of scholars note how uni-directional flows are problematic in their link with evolutionary schemas that place peoples in what Chakrabarty calls the waiting room of history.³² Chakrabarty highlights the temporal

²⁷ Joyce Goodman, "Transatlantic Crossings and Professional Lives: Ellen Knox's Travel between Canada and England," *History of Education Researcher* 89, no. 36-44 (2012). 36-44. For the importance of ships to the reworking of identities see Tamson Pietsch, "A British Sea: Making Sense of Global Space in the Late Nineteenth Century," *Journal of Global History* 5 (2010).

²⁸ Catherine Hall, *Civilising Subjects: Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination, 1830-1867* (Oxford: Polity, 2002). See also "Histories, Empire and the Post-Colonial Question," in *The Postcolonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*, ed. Iain Chambers and Lidia Curti (London: Routledge, 2002). pp.65-77. Catherine Hall and Sonya O. Rose, eds., *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

²⁹ Emily S Rosenberg, *A World Connecting: 1870-1945* (Cambridge, Mass.; London: Harvard University Press, 2012).

³⁰ David Lambert and Alan Lester, *Colonial Lives across the British Empire: Imperial Careering in the Long Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006). Tamson Pietsch, *Empire of Scholars: Universities, Networks and the British Academic World, 1850-1939* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015). Joyce Goodman et al., "Travelling Careers: Overseas Migration Patterns in the Professional Lives of Women Attending Girton and Newnham before 1939," *History of Education* 40, no. 2 (2011).

³¹ Joyce Goodman, Gary McCulloch, and William Richardson, "'Empires Overseas' and 'Empires at Home': Postcolonial and Transnational Perspectives on Social Change in the History of Education," *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 6 (2009). here 296; see for example John MacKenzie, "Empire and Metropolitan Cultures," in *The Oxford History of the British Empire: Volume lii: The Nineteenth Century*, ed. Andrew Porter (Oxford: OUP, 1999).pp.212-31. Linda Colley, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World 1600-1850* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2002). James A Mangan, ed. *Benefits Bestowed?: Education and British Imperialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988). For my understanding of 'empire' and 'imperialism' see Catherine Hall and Sonya O Rose, "Introduction: Being at Home with the Empire," in *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*, ed. Catherine Hall and Sonya O. Rose (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006). pp.1-31. For 'colonization' see Catherine Hall, "Introduction: Thinking the Postcolonial, Thinking the Empire," in *Cultures of Empire: Colonizers in Britain and the Empire in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: A Reader*, ed. Catherine Hall (London: Routledge, 2000). 1-36, here 5.

³² Dipesh Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2000).p.8. "Universalism and Belonging in the Logic of Capital," in *Cosmopolitanism*, ed. Carol A. Breckenridge, et al. (Durham: Duke University Press, 2002). pp.82-110,

nature of Western ideas of progress and of historical writing around comparative frameworks and their temporal notions of 'catch up'.³³ Masako and others unpack how this Western colonial frame played out in accounts of Japanese education.³⁴ Takahashi illustrates how feminists in Japan often used 'bad news' of a gender gap to demonstrate a problem to be solved,³⁵ which overlooked the long tradition of women's learning in Japan.³⁶ The notion of 'catch up' inflects Western reporting of speeches made by Japanese women, to which researchers working within transnational frames need to be attentive.

A report of the speech that Inoue Hide delivered in 1921 at Wellesley College Boston uses this frame. The Wellesley *The College News*, introduces Inoue as the chair of the Japanese Women's Peace Association and as the Dean of the Japanese Women's University in Tokyo. It gives the main points of Inoue's speech and notes that she brought an appeal from the Japanese women to the women of America to support every measure for the reduction of armaments. It then speaks of Inoue's intention to attend the IFUW conference in Paris the following summer:

Mrs Inouye [sic] was for several years a student at Columbia. After leaving Bryn Mawr last Thursday she went to several other Eastern colleges to study their methods with the purpose of bringing the standards of the Japan-Women's University up to American standards. Mrs Inouye was particularly interested in Bryn Mawr, said Mrs Inouye's [sic] hostess, Mrs Alys Russell, because both Bryn Mawr and its president are so well known in Japan.³⁷

The report of Inoue's statement repeats narratives that considered some groups of non-Western women to have progressed less along the road of education and citizenship than women of Western cultures and nations.³⁸ In contrast, scholarship shows the importance of the Japanese members of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, including

here p.82. See also Chakrabarty's claim that the universal acts as a placeholder for historical particularity, p.105.

³³ Thomas Popkewitz, "Comparative Studies and Unthinking Comparative "Thought": The Paradox of "Reason" and Its Abjections," in *New Thinking in Comparative Education: Honouring Robert Cowen*, ed. M.Larsen (London: Sense Publishers, 2010). pp.15-28, here 24. Johannes Fabian, *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*, 2014 ed. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983). pp.2, 6, 13 15, 147.

³⁴ Kentaro Ohukura and Masako Shibata, "Globalization and Education in Japan," in *Globalization and the Study of Education*, ed. Thomas S. Popkewitz and Fazal Rizvi (Malden Mass.: Blackwell, 2010). pp.160-79.

³⁵ Paisley, *Glamour in the Pacific*. p.6.

³⁶ Yuko Takahashi, "Recent Collaborative Endeavors by Historians of Women and Gender in Japan," *Journal of Women's History* 25, no. 4 (2013).

³⁷ 'Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks', *The College News*, 14 December 1921

³⁸ Paisley, *Glamour in the Pacific*. p.6.

its president, Inoue.³⁹ Yasutake also illustrates the centrality of Japanese women to the successful formation of organisations like the Pan Pacific Women's Organisation.⁴⁰ Japanese women can be found networked with key Western women in moving chosen ideals forward. At the 1928 Pan Pacific Women's Conference, Inoue and Kikue Ide, for example, became members of the conference Continuation Committee along with the American Jane Addams and the Australian Bessie Rischbieth.⁴¹

Accounts like Yasutake's study of transnational women's activism in the United States and Japan and Azuma's study of how Japanese immigrants negotiated their racial and class positions,⁴² illustrate the importance of the interconnectedness of political and social factors across national boundaries. It points to the importance of studying interconnectedness and entanglements in transnational space but also power relations in which interconnectedness lies.

I will turn now to discuss transnationalism and entangled histories that stress interconnections.

Transnationalism and entangled histories

Sobe suggests that an 'entangled history' approach is useful for thinking about transcultural interaction in the historical development and operation of schools and school systems.⁴³ Entangled histories look at interconnectedness in movement and exchange in transnational space. They focus on how entanglement informs ideas and practices as they crisscross national borders. Werner and Zimmerman propose that in entangled history entities and objects of research are considered in relation to one another but also through one another, in terms of relationships, interactions and circulation.⁴⁴ A basic assumption of entangled history is that something occurs within the crossing process, which Werner and Zimmerman argue requires historians to pay attention to the consequences of inter-crossing.⁴⁵ To cross, they argue, is also to crisscross, to interweave, to cross over several times at a tempo that may be staggered.

³⁹ Marie Sandell, *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood between the World Wars* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2015). pp.156-7.

⁴⁰ Rumi Yasutake, "The Rise of Women's Internationalism in the Countries of the Asia-Pacific Region During the Interwar Years, from a Japanese Perspective," *Women's History Review* 20, no. 4 (2011).

⁴¹ Eleanor Hinder, "The Outcome of the First Pan Pacific Women's Conference, Honolulu August 9-19 1928," *Mid Pacific Magazine*, no. December (1928).

⁴² Eiichiro Azuma, *Between Two Empires: Race, History, and Transnationalism in Japanese America* (Oxford New York: Oxford University Press, 2005). "'The Pacific Era Has Arrived': Transnational Education among Japanese Americans, 1932-1941," *History of Education Quarterly* 43, no. 1 (2003).

⁴³ Noah W Sobe, "Entanglement and Transnationalism in the History of American Education," in *Rethinking the History of Education: Transnational Perspectives on Its Questions, Methods, and Knowledge*, ed. Thomas S. Popkewitz (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013). pp.93-107.

⁴⁴ Michael Werner and Bénédicte Zimmermann, "Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity," *History and Theory* 45, no. 1 (2006). p.38

⁴⁵ *Ibid.* p.38

This point towards analysis of resistances, inertias, modifications and new combinations that can result from and develop themselves in the process of crossing.⁴⁶

Verbruggen and Carlier use an entangled history approach to look at the transnational cultural transfer and transformation of the American children's library paradigm in continental Europe. They see the Ghent children's library as an initiative embedded in entanglements of social and educational reform and also feminism. They start analysis with the (informal) social network of the 'receiver' in Belgium. They attend to transfer across America and Belgium, but also include visits to London, and a study of children's play hours organised within the Toynbee settlement movement in Great Britain and the Netherlands. They investigate whether it is possible to speak of reciprocity or mutual influences. They use the perspective of entangled history to bring to light a multilateral transfer through international congresses and periodicals. They reveal a history entangled in transnational processes and partially overlapping intellectual networks of feminists, social and Lebens-reformers and progressive educationists. They argue that intellectual sociability was an important element in the operation of the network of groups.⁴⁷

The intellectual sociability to which Verbruggen and Carlier refer was one of the mechanisms that oiled the wheels of transnational entanglements during the interwar period. Sociability was an important aspect of interwar cultural internationalism as it interwove with scientific internationalism. Both cultural and scientific internationalism built on the language of co-operation that was embedded in the 'new internationalism' that developed during and after the First World War.

I will now turn to the language of co-operation that was deployed in the drive to create a new international order.

Transnationalism and the language of co-operation

During the interwar period, liberal internationalism was often expressed through a language of co-operation that provided public intellectuals with a different way of talking about international relations and about national sovereignty. In unpacking the language of co-operation, I draw on the work of Tröhler, who outlines the usefulness of the notion of 'languages' in illuminating how people think, talk, or write as modes or modalities. Following Tröhler my use of the term 'language of co-operation' is based on the distinction de Saussure developed between speech (*parole*) and language (*langue*), as a theoretical regulating system. Tröhler writes that languages in this sense are modes or modalities of thought. He sees language (*langue*) as specifically used rhetoric and vocabulary that frames the speech (*parole*) of the actors. Tröhler argues that language (*langue*) construes what is perceived as social

⁴⁶ Ibid. p.38

⁴⁷ Christophe Verbruggen and Julie Carlier, "An Entangled History of Ideas and Ideals: Feminism, Social and Educational Reform in Children's Libraries in Belgium before the First World War," *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 3 (2009).

reality. He notes that every epoch has its dominant mode or modality of perceiving, analysing and discussing phenomena but it also has alternative modes that operate in the background or underground. Changes in regard to what is dominant results from crises when people resort to another language (*langue*) that seems to describe their circumstances in a more appropriate way. Tröhler sees one of the main advantages of looking at languages, rather than at arguments is that they are principally transnational and transcend the national scope.⁴⁸

The language of co-operation that underpinned the 'new internationalism' of the interwar period built on the belief that peace could be fostered through the engagement of elites with cultural, intellectual and psychological aspects of the international order and by shaping public opinion via popular culture.⁴⁹ In the language of co-operation the world was made up of interdependent groups. Trentmann argues that sovereignty faces inward and 'marshals its forces against the foreigner' but co-operation looks outward and 'transforms what has been strange and foreign into elements of ... collaboration for recognised common interests'. As a result, co-operation creates a shared international mentality above the level of nation states. It does so, Trentmann argues, without denying the constitutional sovereignty of individual national states.⁵⁰ It also provided space for expansionism in foreign policy.⁵¹ In the inter-war period, the language of co-operation provided an alternative to the language of centralisation based around the notion of a world state.⁵²

The languages of co-operation and centralisation played out at the League of Nations in debates around education. When the proposal for the International Committee for Intellectual Co-operation (ICIC) was presented in Geneva in 1921, the word education that had been included in the draft proposal for the committee was omitted. So, too were plans for the establishment of an International Bureau of Education. This omission was to avoid the situation that an International Bureau collecting information about the 'progress' of education in different countries would open the League to the charge of 'interference' in national education systems⁵³ and so a move to the creation of a world state.⁵⁴ Marie Curie summed up

⁴⁸ Daniel Tröhler, *Languages of Education: Protestant Legacies, National Identities, and Global Aspirations* (London: Routledge, 2012).

⁴⁹ Akira Iriye, *Cultural Internationalism and World Order* (Baltimore, Md. ; London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997). p.60.

⁵⁰ Frank Trentmann, "After the Nation-State: Citizenship, Empire and Global Coordination in the New Internationalism, 1914-1930," in *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism C.1880-1950*, ed. Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine, and Frank Trentmann (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005). pp.34-53.

⁵¹ Thomas W. Burkman, *Japan and the League of Nations: Empire and World Order, 1914-1938* (Honolulu, T.H.: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008). p.149.

⁵² Trentmann, "After the Nation-State." pp.34-53, here p.43.

⁵³ Pedro Rosselló, *Forerunners of the International Bureau of Education: A Hitherto Unrecorded Aspect of the History of Education and of International Institutions*, trans. Marie Butts (London: Evans Brothers Ltd., 1944). p.60.

⁵⁴ Jeanne Morefield, *Covenants without Swords: Idealist Liberalism and the Spirit of Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005).

this position in a discussion in 1930 on why elementary education did not appear in the work plans of the ICIC or the Paris Institute for Intellectual Co-operation (IIIC). Curie said it was 'because, from the beginning, it had been formally prohibited, as the Committee could not in any way interfere in the various countries in matters which related to Government decisions'. Education was seen as a 'reserved sphere'. ICIC member, Alfredo Rocco, added that the danger of dealing with such a question arose from the fact that the development of the child was considered as one of the most fundamental attributes of the sovereignty of States.⁵⁵

The language of co-operation was manifest in the term the 'international mind', which linked nationalism and internationalism through development of 'new liberal' thought.⁵⁶ The term 'international mind' was coined by the American Nicholas Murray Butler, of Columbia University. Murray Butler saw nations possessing minds and consciences which were to be brought to bear on the moral problems of international relations. The 'international mind' was to be created by the development of reason over passion, which he thought was key to seeing peoples from different nations as friends working to a common purpose.⁵⁷ For Alfred Zimmern, Deputy Director of the IIIC, the 'international mind' had a spiritual dimension. Cultivating understanding of international affairs through reason was, for Zimmern, not just a matter of more advanced opinions or greater international information. It involved knowledge of relations between peoples, and knowledge of the peoples themselves.⁵⁸ The development of a particular attitude to 'meeting foreign minds, minds which work in a way unfamiliar' and learning to 'encounter them with joy and a sense of adventure'⁵⁹ was to result in 'a new spirit between the nations'.⁶⁰

Virginia Gildersleeve, Dean of Barnard College, spoke of the 'international mind' to an audience of women in the IFUW. Gildersleeve saw the international mind as the 'the mind which accepts as normal international co-operation rather than competition, and friendly understanding rather than hostile suspicion'. Gildersleeve considered 'real' international understanding to be difficult because of racial psychology which she thought led people to hold different underlying ideas, traditions and values. To enable nations to work together for a better world, she thought what was needed was to 'weave webs of thought, of understanding,

⁵⁵ ICIC, "Minutes of the Twelfth Session. Held at Geneva from Wednesday, July 23rd, to Tuesday, July 29th, 1930, 13 August 1930 [C.428.M.192.1930.X11 [C.I.C.I./12th Session/P.V.]]," (1930).pp.23-4, 27.

⁵⁶ Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific*.p.9.

⁵⁷ Nicholas Murray Butler, *The International Mind: An Argument for the Judicial Settlement of International Disputes* (New York: Shares Scribner's Sons, 1913).

⁵⁸ Alfred E Zimmern, *The League of Nations and the Rule of Law: 1918 - 1935* (London: Macmillan, 1936). p.5.

⁵⁹ "The Development of the International Mind," in *Problems of Peace: Lectures Delivered at the Geneva Inst. Of International Relations*, ed. Alfred E Zimmern (Geneva: Institute of International Relations, 1932). pp.1-27, here pp.4, 5.

⁶⁰ "Introductory," in *The War and Democracy*, ed. Arthur Greenwood, et al. (London, 1914). pp.1-17, here 17.

of friendliness, of co-operation', which she called 'weaving the invisible filaments of the mind and of the spirit'.⁶¹ Like Zimmern, Gildersleeve thought the 'international mind' required the development of an international attitude in the national mind.⁶²

Gildersleeve's phrase, 'weaving webs of thought, of understanding, of friendliness, of co-operation', brought together two key aspects through which the language of co-operation was articulated: the rationality of thought, which mapped onto scientific internationalism; and the emotion of friendliness, which provided a more cultural approach to internationalism. These interwove in transnational networking and exchange in the IFUW, where Gildersleeve served as president.

I will now use the IFUW to look at the interweaving of scientific internationalism and cultural internationalism

Scientific internationalism and cultural internationalism

The IFUW was established to ensure women's access to science and higher education worldwide and developed into 'a transnational network to assist academic women'.⁶³ It was established by North American and British women to promote understanding and friendship between university women of different nations and to further their interests.⁶⁴ Caroline Spurgeon, first president, summed up the threefold aims of the IFUW as international friendship, internationalism in learning and knowledge; and developing, widening and enriching the process of education generally.⁶⁵

Like the League of Nations, the IFUW promoted scientific internationalism and saw a key role for the expert in creating the spirit of internationalism. In League of Nations (SDN) publications the intellectual's cultural authority was portrayed in terms of providing objective knowledge as part of the duty of the intellectual to promote 'the concord of minds, without which legal conventions for world peace would be both powerless and lifeless'.⁶⁶ Henri Bonnet, the director of the IICC noted that 'disinterested knowledge' was to be put to political use as 'the

⁶¹ Virginia Crocheron Gildersleeve, "The Creation of the International Mind," in Gildersleeve Collection (Mss: Columbia University, nd).

⁶² Zimmern, "The Development of the International Mind." pp.1-17, here p.1.

⁶³ Christina von Oertzen, *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014). p.vii.

⁶⁴ IFUW, in *Report of the First Conference, July, 1920* (1920). pp.3, 10. Delegates at the first conference in London were from America, France, Italy, Spain, Belgium, Holland, Denmark, Norway, Sweden, Czecho-Slovakia, India, Canada, Australia, South Africa.

⁶⁵ Theodora Bosanquet, "The Aims and Record of the International Federation," in *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929* (London: IFUW, 1929).p.51.

⁶⁶ SDN, *International Intellectual Co-Operation 1933* (Paris: International Institute of Intellectual Co-operation, 1934). pp.4, 18, 19.

best means of opening an avenue to co-operation and peace in other fields of activity'.⁶⁷ In a framework based on co-operation between discrete nation states science acted to shape the practice of co-operative internationalism. Stefan-Fritz argues that the discovery of empirical facts and their rational application was to promote societal co-operation by replacing the dominant state-interest perspective of international relations with a knowledge-based one that operated through an international scientific community.⁶⁸ The League of Nations technical sections brought in 'so-called independent experts' from a range of countries, selected for their ability to deal with particular international problems.⁶⁹ Mirroring League of Nations' practice, the IFUW chose women for IFUW committees entirely as experts and not as representatives of particular associations.⁷⁰

Von Oertzen argues that one of the most important branches of the IFUW's work was the endowment of women's fellowships for travel and research in arts and sciences. The IFUW fellowship scheme was intended to redress the small number of international fellowships available to women; and it was to provide access to research opportunities overseas at a time when research was increasingly being undertaken within international networks. To advance knowledge and to support women's academic development decisions on the award of international fellowships for postgraduate research were based on the highest intellectual standards. There was no reference to an applicant's personal situation.⁷¹ Experience as an international fellow overseas was thought to build knowledge of foreign nations and of international affairs through personal contact with other countries. In this way notions of scientific internationalism and cultural internationalism came together as the 'invisible filaments of the mind and of the spirit' that Gildersleeve saw as elements of the 'international mind'.⁷²

⁶⁷ Henri Bonnet, "Recent Developments in International Intellectual Co-Operation," *Information Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1932).

⁶⁸ This stance overlooked questions of power and national self-interest. Jan-Stefan Fritz, "Internationalism and the Promise of Science," in *Imperialism and Internationalism in the Discipline of International Relations*, ed. David Long and Brian C. Schmidt (Albany: SUNY, 2005). pp.141-158, here pp.142-4.

⁶⁹ The term 'so-called independent experts' is from Clavin and Wessels, who argue that in the context of the Economic and Financial organisation of the League, experts mirrored the membership of nation-states with permanent seats on the Council. See Patricia Clavin and Jens-Wilhelm Wessels, "Transnationalism and the League of Nations: Understanding the Work of Its Economic and Financial Organisation," *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 4 (2005). here, p.472.

⁷⁰ Bosanquet, "The Aims and Record of the International Federation." p.54.

⁷¹ von Oertzen, *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*. pp.44, 46.

⁷² IFUW, "Committee on Intellectual Co-Operation," in *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928* (London: IFUW, 1928). "Resolution - Intellectual Co-Operation," in *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928* (London: IFUW, 1928). pp.95-6.

Central to the creation of the IFUW's transnational network of women academics was the IFUW's organisation of accommodation at Crosby Hall in London and Reid Hall in Paris.⁷³ Crosby Hall was fitted out as an international hall of residence. There was a library, a dining room and clubroom. University women studying and researching in London, and travelling IFUW members, paid to stay at Crosby Hall. Crosby Hall developed an open international ethos that promoted intercultural exchange that was referred to as the 'spirit' of Crosby Hall,⁷⁴ which resonates with descriptions of the 'spirit' of Geneva.⁷⁵ Crosby Hall became central in the IFUW's matrix of hospitality. Visits to other parts of Britain were organised for overseas residents to meet with women from local associations of the British Federation of University Women and individual BFUW members hosted overseas women scholars.⁷⁶ Letters of introduction, social programmes, entertainments, welcomes, hostesses, tea parties and visits all oiled the wheels in creating the transnational network of scholarly women.⁷⁷

We glimpse this hospitality in the *College News* fragment I quoted earlier, which referred to Inoue's hostess, Mrs Alys Russell.⁷⁸ The American Alys Smith Russell was a niece of Carey Thomas, Dean of Bryn Mawr, where Russell had studied before her family moved to England and she had become the wife of the English philosopher Bertrand Russell.⁷⁹ A very well-connected, well-travelled and wealthy woman and a leading light in the British and International federations of university women, Russell epitomises a transnational life.⁸⁰ Her activities at the centre of the networks of funding and of hospitality at Crosby Hall, and at the British and international federations, situates her in Saunier's terms as a transnational 'connector', who mobilised resources and occupied positions that cut through different levels at which transnationalism operated.⁸¹ The gendered activities like teas parties and receptions with which Russell was concerned were important in cementing international friendship, and hospitality. This fostered the movement of women and contributed to building the transnational network of scholars.

⁷³ SDN, "Meeting of Representatives of International Student Organisations, Minutes of the Fourth Meeting Held on April 9 1926, Sdn Archive Geneva, Icic Box R1017.," (SDN).

⁷⁴ von Oertzen, *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*. p.41.

⁷⁵ For a similar description of the home of the Nitobes beside Lac Léman as providing a place of hospitality see Burkman, *Japan and the League of Nations*.pp.153, 157.

⁷⁶ von Oertzen, *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*. pp.42, 43.

⁷⁷ Stephanie Spencer, "Cosmopolitan Sociability in the British and International Federations of University Women, 1945–1960," *Women's History Review* (2016).

⁷⁸ "Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks," *The College News*, 14 December 1921.

⁷⁹ They were married in 1894 and divorced in 1921 but were estranged for much of this period.

⁸⁰ Lesley Deacon, Penny Russell, and Angela Woollacott, "Introduction," in *Transnational Lives: Biographies of Colonial Modernity 1700-Present*, ed. Lesley Deacon, Penny Russell, and Angela Woollacott (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2010). pp.1-11.

⁸¹ Pierre-Yves Saunier, *Transnational History* (London: Routledge, 2013). p.57.

Russell's work for the Crosby Hall hospitality committee was a facet of the cosmopolitan sociabilities that established cosmopolitan solidarities amongst the transnational network of scholars.⁸² In cosmopolitan sociability people are active participants in practices that create common places that span the transnational.⁸³ Schiller, Darieva and Gruner-Dominic define sociability as a form of interaction that builds on certain shared human competencies to relate to multiple other persons. They see cosmopolitan sociability consisting of 'forms of competence and communication skills that are based on the human capacity to create social relations of inclusiveness and openness to the world'. They argue that cosmopolitan sociability is an ability to find aspects of the shared human experience despite what would seem to be divides of culture and belief. They argue that cosmopolitan sociabilities are challenged or facilitated in different historical contexts and locations and are enacted and embedded within social relations and practice-based identities.⁸⁴

Sociability in the transnational network of the IFUW also demonstrates ways in which cosmopolitan sociability is shaped by the circumstances of its practice and can be intersected by the power relations of ethnicity and 'race'.⁸⁵ In the transnational network of the IFUW cosmopolitan sociability was limited by the reach of the IFUW's connections with graduate women outside Europe and America,⁸⁶ and because IFUW conferences were largely conducted in English.⁸⁷ Sandell notes that this favoured 'Westernized' women from outside Europe who were fluent in Western languages and had first-hand familiarity with Western culture and female activism.⁸⁸ Their interaction, she says, was eased by Western-style education and often by links with Christianity.⁸⁹

To end I want to use Kawai Michi's 1921 journey to Europe and America to think about the relationship between institution building, networking and opportunities for transnational engagement.

Structuring transnational engagement

⁸² Noah W Sobe, *Provincializing the Worldly Citizen: Yugoslav Student and Teacher Travel and Slavic Cosmopolitanism in the Interwar Era* (Peter Lang, 2008). p.68.

⁸³ Massey, *For Space*.

⁸⁴ Nina Glick Schiller, Tsypylma Darieva, and Sandra Gruner-Domic, "Defining Cosmopolitan Sociability in a Transnational Age. An Introduction," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34, no. 3 (2011). here p.402-3.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.* here p.403.

⁸⁶ Sandell, *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood between the World Wars*.p.122.

⁸⁷ There were some contributions in French and German.

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

⁸⁹ "Learning in and from the West: International Students and International Women's Organisations in the Interwar Period," *History of Education* 44, no. 1 (2014). here p.22.

By 1920, Kawai had given up teaching at Tsuda College and had become a full-time secretary of the Japanese YWCA. By this point she was a well-connected and experienced traveller. She had studied at Bryn Mawr in Philadelphia and at the YWCA National Training School in New York. She had spoken to audiences in Europe, Canada and America.⁹⁰ In *My Lantern* Kawai notes her attendance at the World YWCA executive meeting at Champéry, Switzerland. She records that she travelled to New York with Watanabe Yuri, who was on her way to Columbia University for advanced study. On the way the two women attended the biennial convention of the American YWCA at Cleveland, Ohio. In New York, Kawai met Harriet Taylor, with whom she sailed to Europe to attend the World YWCA executive meeting in Switzerland. After Champéry Kawai called in on the Conference of the International Alliance of Women nearby at Geneva. Not mentioned in *My Lantern* is her attendance at the IFUW conference in London.

Kawai records that at the American YWCA Convention in Cleveland she made 'a plea for better international understanding'.⁹¹ At the World's YWCA meeting she was appointed a corresponding vice president to represent Asia; but she does not record this at this point in *My Lantern*.⁹² She does, however, note that at the International Alliance of Women, she was part of a platform of 'Oriental' representatives.⁹³ There is no mention that at the IFUW conference she spoke about a petition in Japan for women's higher education.⁹⁴

Kawai's itinerary looks like this

April 13-20 1920 American YWCA, Sixth National Convention, Cleveland, Ohio
June 11-14 1920 Meetings of the World's YWCA, Champéry, Switzerland
June 12 1920 International Alliance of Women, Eighth Conference, Geneva, Switzerland (This conference ran from the 6 th to the 12 th June 1920 and Kawai appears to have attended the final session.)
July 1920 International Federation of University Women, First Conference, London

⁹⁰ M. Kawai, *My Lantern* (Tokyo: Kyo Bun Kwan, 1940). pp.137-147.

⁹¹ *Ibid.* p.148.

⁹² WYWCA, "Minutes of the Meetings of the World's Young Women's Christian Association Committee, Champéry, June 11-14, 1920," (1920). p.4.

⁹³ Kawai, *My Lantern*. p.148.

⁹⁴ Sandell, *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood between the World Wars*. p.124.

Contrasting Kawai's account of the International Alliance of Women at Geneva with the Cleveland Conference in Hawai is instructive. Kawai notes of the International Alliance:

One evening was given over to the Oriental representatives and I was invited to the platform, along with Mrs Tsune Yamada Gauntlett, a noted Japanese social worker and seven Hindu ladies in gorgeous clothes, glittering with gold and silver. Among them was the famous poetess, Mrs Naidu, who spoke eloquently with artistic gestures; also a Hindu woman lawyer.⁹⁵

Paisley notes ways that dress became a marker of nation.⁹⁶ Sandell argues that such accounts also speak to the importance that international women's organisations placed on the participation of women from countries in Asia. Their participation was seen as a measure of an organisations' internationalism. In this sense, Sandell says, women became 'symbols' of internationalism.⁹⁷ We see this in the way that Kawai records Carrie Chapman Catt's speech. She writes:

It was my first suffrage convention, and I was struck by the forthright manner of speaking of Mrs Catt. 'People of Geneva', came her clear voice, 'do you realize that these Oriental sisters already have their civil rights? Women of Geneva, do you see that Japan is working for woman's suffrage? People from all over the world, why do you deny the right of suffrage to women?'⁹⁸

The comments on the eloquence of Sarojini Naidu, with her poetic gestures, and the forthright manner and clear voice of Carrie Chapman Catt, show Kawai reflecting on different ways in which women engaged in the international arena.

At the American YWCA convention in Cleveland, Kawai encountered a very different context.⁹⁹ Forty-four African American women attended the Cleveland conference. Robertson traces how for the African-American attendees interracial co-operation in the American YWCA was an issue. Their struggle over practices of interracial co-operation went to the heart of the meaning of Christian citizenship and Christian internationalism. At the Cleveland convention, Clementine Hodges, the delegate from Wilberforce University, the oldest private African-

⁹⁵ Kawai, *My Lantern*.p.148. Naidu worked closely with Gandhi. For an account that links Naidu's literary and national activities see P.E. Brinks, *Anglophone Indian Women Writers, 1870–1920* (Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2013).

⁹⁶ Paisley, *Glamour in the Pacific*.

⁹⁷ Marie Sandell, "'A Real Meeting of the Women of the East and West': Women and Internationalism in the Interwar Period," in *Internationalism Reconfigured: Transnational Ideas and Movements between the World Wars*, ed. Daniel Laqua (New York: I.B.Tauris Co.Ltd, 2011). pp.161-86, here p.172.

⁹⁸ Kawai, *My Lantern*.p.148.

⁹⁹ This and the following paragraph draws heavily on Nancy M Robertson, *Christian Sisterhood, Race Relations, and the Ywca, 1906-46* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2007). chapter 4.

American university in the United States, appealed on behalf of 'eight hundred negro girls' for the YWCA membership to be expanded. This, she said, would 'be a benefit not only to our people and not only to the Anglo-Saxon races, but to the entire inhabitants of this universe'. Furthermore, she said, 'a more inclusive association would help build a new world'. Robertson notes that accepted wisdom among white American YWCA members was that these ideals were intended to support workers, whom most white American YWCA members thought of as white. But African American members often read in this a racial message about the YWCA standing for '[e]qual rights and justice for all men in all stations of life'. At the convention, Mary J. McCrorey, a delegate from a black YWCA branch linked this to the opportunity 'to spread this work over the Southland, and give to the women of our race the great privileges of this Association'.¹⁰⁰

At the time of the 1920 Cleveland convention, many American YWCA branches were segregated along racial lines. Segregated branches for black YWCA members frequently had poorer facilities than those in branches for white members. Issues of power and self-government also divided the American YWCA along lines of race. Black women were members of the boards of directors for black YWCA branches and they were also members of the local city YWCA boards, but there were no black member on the YWCA national board. Furthermore, the African American women attending the Cleveland convention were excluded from the convention banquet. Their conference dinner was organised at the local (white) YWCA.

Black women were likely to have interpreted Kawai's 'plea for better international understanding' through the idea that world peace began at home with inter-racial understanding. For black women, the religious lens through which they interpreted inter-racial understanding hinged around suffering, but for white women this lens related to sin. Kawai's message to the convention flowed through a language of co-operation that was differently refracted through 'race' for white and black delegates. Robertson concludes that divisions along racial lines in the American YWCA were often cast as individuals' misunderstandings of a personal nature and so amenable to education; but in fact these divisions were deeply structural. Robertson's analysis points to the power of structural issues in shaping transnational engagement and in shaping how transnational messages were received.

Kawai told the women attending the IFUW conference in London that a petition, signed by many hundred women, in favour of facilities for the higher education of women, had been presented to the Japanese Diet that year and in 1919 a National College Association had been

¹⁰⁰ YWCA, "National Young Women's Christian Association, Proceedings of the Sixth National Convention Cleveland, Ohio, April 13-20, 1920," (1920). p.122 122 quoted in Robertson, *Christian Sisterhood, Race Relations, and the Ywca, 1906-46*. pp.210-11.

formed in Japan. She also spoke about the international character of the Student Christian Federation and she expressed the hope that the two federations would cooperate in bringing a better and fuller life to the women of the world.¹⁰¹

At the following 1922 IFUW conference, Caroline Spurgeon, IFUW president, spoke of Japanese women's interest in the IFUW and of their activity in Japan.¹⁰² At the 1922 IFUW conference, Mrs Fujisawa, a graduate of the Women's University of Tokyo represented the University Women of Japan.¹⁰³ She spoke to the conference of the progress of democracy in Japan, which, she noted, had enabled women to enjoy rights formerly unknown, especially in the field of education. She said:

The educational course in Japan consisted of 6 years of preparatory education, 5 of secondary education, and 5 of university education. A Women's University was in existence, which gave instruction in Philosophy, Literature, Science and Medicine. The Federation of Japanese University Women would therefore have the right to enter the International Federation on the same terms as the other federations.¹⁰⁴

At the third IFUW conference in Christiania in 1924, however there was no mention of Japan. At the 1929 Geneva conference, Miss Ewing from America said the IFUW would be incomplete until it included Chinese and Japanese women. But the affiliation of the Japanese Federation did not come about until after the Second World War. This was not simply a question of politics, nor of the distance of Japan geographically. Gildersleeve's reply to Miss Ewing showed that the structures that determined IFUW membership were a barrier.

The IFUW illustrates what Zimmerman terms a process of nationalisation through internationalisation. In this process new national societies are formed or new federations are formed in order to affiliate with an international society.¹⁰⁵ The IFUW Constitution stipulated that the term 'national federation' was not to mean an exclusively racial society. The intention was for all university women living in the same geographical area to combine into one federation representing the country in which they lived. This gave rise to ethnically diverse federations. A graduate of an American University resident in Britain, for example, was eligible for membership in the American Association of Collegiate Alumnae and for membership of the

¹⁰¹ IFUW, "Japan," in Report of the First Conference, July, 1920 (London: IFUW, 1920). p.54.

¹⁰² Caroline Spurgeon, "The Growth of the International Federation," in Ifuw, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922 (London: IFUW, 1922). pp.18-19, here 18.

¹⁰³ IFUW, "List of Delegates," *ibid.* pp.11-14, here 14.

¹⁰⁴ "The University Women of Japan," in Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922 (London: IFUW, 1922). p.30.

¹⁰⁵ Susan Zimmerman, "The Challenge of Multinational Empire for the International Women's Movement: The Habsburg Monarchy and the Development of Feminist Inter/National Politics," *Journal of Women's History* 17, no. 2 (2005). P.87.

British Federation of University Women.¹⁰⁶ Clare Loomis, of the American Association of University Women (AAUW), who travelled in China and Japan, told the 1922 IFUW conference that an association had been formed in Japan, which had done excellent work in uniting English, American and Japanese women, many of whom had studied abroad. In the near future she thought, the question of a truly national organisation would probably be brought forward.¹⁰⁷ Gildersleeve's reply shows that the problem was one of definition around the meaning of 'truly national'. The Tokyo Branch was an offshoot of the AAUW. This was not what the IFUW deemed to be a national association. IFUW membership regulations for associations were based on territorial notions of the nation state.¹⁰⁸ Gildersleeve told the 1929 conference that the branch of the AAUW in Japan had been instructed to try and start a 'genuine' Japanese Association as part of its work.¹⁰⁹ Structural issues in the IFUW linked with maternalist attitudes on the part of women like Gildersleeve overlooked Japanese women's agency.

In contrast, regional translocal structures that looked towards the national on the one hand and supra-nationally on the other facilitated women's transnational visibility. Kawai's appointment in the WYWCA as regional vice president for Asia meant she was feted in WYWCA photographs but not with the orientalist tinge that runs as a thread through the International Alliance of Women's description; nor with the maternalism of Gildersleeve's approach. As regional representative for Asia Kawai is visible linking Japan at the level of nation on the one hand and the World YWCA in the transnational realm on the other. Here she is a worker in her own right in the thread of fellowship that which the WYCA saw being 'woven into the fabric of the nations', and the thread on which 'depended the harmony and strength of the finished world pattern'.¹¹⁰

Conclusion

To conclude, women's conversations about education connect across and between imperial spaces. Their conversations about education become entangled and circulate as women's networks create new spaces of transnational connection and of education. Women's engagement in scientific and cultural internationalism form channels and means through which their activity becomes visible in international structures that facilitate and / or constrain their activity in the transnational realm.

¹⁰⁶ IFUW, "Notes on the Constitution and Bye Laws," in Report of the First Conference, 1920 (London: IFUW, 1920). p.77.

¹⁰⁷ "University Women of the East." pp.33-34.

¹⁰⁸ This chimes with the analysis of internationalism from Hirst, Thompson, and Bromley, *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance*. pp.16-19.

¹⁰⁹ IFUW, "Summary of Dr Von Zahn Harnack's Speech," in Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929 (London: IFUW, 1929). pp.60-69, here 69.

¹¹⁰ YWCA, *How Wide Is Your Circle* (New York: YWCA, 1920). Final page.

Historians of gender and education are increasingly taking up questions of transnational circulation and connections. But as Rogers recently highlighted, there is no entry concerning education or schools in Iriye and Saunier's *Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History*.¹¹¹ Similarly there is no reference to education or schools in either Iriye's *Global and Transnational History*,¹¹² or Saunier's *Transnational History*.¹¹³ Yet, accounts from many countries show that education was a key site for women's engagement at local, national, international and transnational levels. As historians research gender and women's education they also have to work for the recognition of the history of women's education in the field of transnational history.

¹¹¹ Akira Iriye and Pierre-Yves Saunier, *The Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History: From the Mid-19th Century to the Present* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).

¹¹² Akira Iriye, *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013).

¹¹³ Saunier, *Transnational History*.

Bibliography

- Akami, Tomoko. *Internationalizing the Pacific: The United States, Japan and the Institute of Pacific Relations in War and Peace, 1919-45*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Azuma, Eiichiro. *Between Two Empires : Race, History, and Transnationalism in Japanese America*. Oxford New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- . "'The Pacific Era Has Arrived': Transnational Education among Japanese Americans, 1932-1941." *History of Education Quarterly* 43, no. 1 (2003): 39-73.
- Berkovitch, Nitza. *From Motherhood to Citizenship*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1999.
- Bonnet, Henri. "Recent Developments in International Intellectual Co-Operation." *Information Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1932): 5.
- Bosanquet, Theodora. "The Aims and Record of the International Federation." In *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*. London: IFUW, 1929.
- Brinks, P.E. *Anglophone Indian Women Writers, 1870–1920*. Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2013.
- Burkman, Thomas W. *Japan and the League of Nations: Empire and World Order, 1914-1938*. Honolulu, T.H.: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008.
- Butler, Nicholas Murray. *The International Mind: An Argument for the Judicial Settlement of International Disputes*. New York: Shares Scribner's Sons, 1913.
- Carlier, Julie. "Forgotten Transnational Connections and National Contexts: An "Entangled History" of the Political Transfers That Shaped Belgian Feminism, 1890-1914." *Women's History Review* 19, no. 4 (2010): 502-33.
- Caruso, Marcelo. "World Systems, World Society, World Polity: Theoretical Insights for a Global History of Education." *History of Education* 37, no. 6 (2008): 825-40.
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh. *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2000.
- . "Universalism and Belonging in the Logic of Capital." In *Cosmopolitanism*, edited by Carol A. Breckenridge, Sheldon I. Pollock, Homi K. Bhabha and Dipesh Chakrabarty, 82-110. Durham: Duke University Press, 2002.
- Clavin, Patricia. "Defining Transnationalism." *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 2 (2005): 421-39.

Clavin, Patricia, and Jens-Wilhelm Wessels. "Transnationalism and the League of Nations: Understanding the Work of Its Economic and Financial Organisation." *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 4 (2005): 465-92.

Colley, Linda. *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World 1600-1850*. London: Jonathan Cape, 2002.

Cunningham, Peter. "Educational Pioneering and Cultural Exchange: The Case of Elizabeth Hughes (1851-1925)." ISCHE 37 Istanbul, 2015.

Deacon, Lesley, Penny Russell, and Angela Woollacott. "Introduction." In *Transnational Lives: Biographies of Colonial Modernity 1700-Present*, edited by Lesley Deacon, Penny Russell and Angela Woollacott, 1-11. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2010.

Fabian, Johannes. *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*. 2014 ed. New York: Columbia University Press, 1983.

Fritz, Jan-Stefan. "Internationalism and the Promise of Science." In *Imperialism and Internationalism in the Discipline of International Relations*, edited by David Long and Brian C. Schmidt, 141-58. Albany: SUNY, 2005.

Fuchs, Eckhardt. "History of Education Beyond the Nation? Trends in Historical and Educational Scholarship." In *Connecting Histories of Education: Transnational and Cross-Cultural Exchanges in (Post-)Colonial Education*, edited by Barnita Bagchi, Eckhardt Fuchs and Kate Rousmaniere, 11-26. New York: Berghahn Books, 2014.

Gildersleeve, Virginia Crocheron. "The Creation of the International Mind." In *Gildersleeve Collection*. Mss: Columbia University, nd.

Goodman, Joyce. "'Their Market Value Must Be Greater for the Experience They Had Gained': Secondary School Headmistresses and Empire 1897-1914." In *Gender, Colonialism and Education: The Politics of Experience*, edited by Joyce Goodman and Jane Martin, 175-98. London: Woburn Press, 2002.

———. "Transatlantic Crossings and Professional Lives: Ellen Knox's Travel between Canada and England." *History of Education Researcher* 89, no. 36-44 (2012).

Goodman, Joyce, Andrea Jacobs, Fiona Kisby, and Helen Loader. "Travelling Careers: Overseas Migration Patterns in the Professional Lives of Women Attending Girton and Newnham before 1939." *History of Education* 40, no. 2 (2011/03/01 2011): 179-96.

Goodman, Joyce, Gary McCulloch, and William Richardson. "'Empires Overseas' and 'Empires at Home': Postcolonial and Transnational Perspectives on Social Change in the History of Education." *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 6 (2009/12/01 2009): 695-706.

Grant, Kevin, Philippa Levine, and Frank Trentmann. "Introduction." In *Beyond Sovereignty: Britian, Empire and Transnationalism c1880-1950*, edited by Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine and Frank Trentmann Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005.

Hall, Catherine. *Civilising Subjects: Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination, 1830-1867*. Oxford: Polity, 2002.

———. "Histories, Empire and the Post-Colonial Question." In *The Postcolonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*, edited by Iain Chambers and Lidia Curti, 65-77. London: Routledge, 2002.

———. "Introduction: Thinking the Postcolonial, Thinking the Empire." In *Cultures of Empire: Colonizers in Britain and the Empire in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: A Reader*, edited by Catherine Hall, 1-36. London: Routledge, 2000.

Hall, Catherine, and Sonya O Rose. "Introduction: Being at Home with the Empire." In *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*, edited by Catherine Hall and Sonya O. Rose, 1-31. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

Hall, Catherine, and Sonya O. Rose, eds. *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

Hinder, Eleanor. "The Outcome of the First Pan Pacific Women's Conference, Honolulu August 9-19 1928." *Mid Pacific Magazine*, no. December (1928): 407-10.

Hirst, Paul, Grahame Thompson, and Simon Bromley. *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1996.

ICIC. "Minutes of the Twelfth Session. Held at Geneva from Wednesday, July 23rd, to Tuesday, July 29th, 1930, 13 August 1930 [C.428.M.192.1930.X11 [C.I.C.I./12th Session/P.V.]]." (1930).

IFUW. In Report of the First Conference, July, 1920, 1920.

———. "Committee on Intellectual Co-Operation." In *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW, 1928.

———. "Japan." In Report of the First Conference, July, 1920, 54. London: IFUW, 1920.

———. "List of Delegates." In *Ifuw, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW, 1922.

———. "Notes on the Constitution and Bye Laws." In *Report of the First Conference, 1920*. London: IFUW, 1920.

———. "Resolution - Intellectual Co-Operation." In *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW, 1928.

———. "Summary of Dr Von Zahn Harnack's Speech." In *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*, 60-69. London: IFUW, 1929.

———. "The University Women of Japan." In Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922, 30. London: IFUW, 1922.

———. "University Women of the East." In Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922. London: IFUW, 1922.

Iriye, Akira. *Cultural Internationalism and World Order*. Baltimore, Md. ; London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.

———. *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

Iriye, Akira, and Pierre-Yves Saunier. *The Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History: From the Mid-19th Century to the Present*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Kawai, M. *My Lantern*. Tokyo: Kyo Bun Kwan, 1940.

Lambert, David, and Alan Lester. *Colonial Lives across the British Empire: Imperial Careering in the Long Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.

MacKenzie, John. "Empire and Metropolitan Cultures." In *The Oxford History of the British Empire: Volume iii: The Nineteenth Century*, edited by Andrew Porter, 212-31. Oxford: OUP, 1999.

Mangan, James A, ed. *Benefits Bestowed?: Education and British Imperialism*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988.

Massey, Doreen B. *For Space*. London: Sage, 2005.

Mazlish, Bruce. "Comparing Global History to World History." *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 28, no. 3 (1998): 385-95.

Mazlish, Bruce, and Akira Iriye. *The Global History Reader*. London: Routledge, 2005.

Morefield, Jeanne. *Covenants without Swords: Idealist Liberalism and the Spirit of Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005.

Ohukura, Kentaro, and Masako Shibata. "Globalization and Education in Japan." In *Globalization and the Study of Education*, edited by Thomas S. Popkewitz and Fazal Rizvi, 160-79. Malden Mass.: Blackwell, 2010.

Paisley, Fiona. *Glamour in the Pacific: Cultural Internationalism and Race Politics in the Women's Pan-Pacific*. Honolulu: University of Hawai Press, 2009.

- Pietsch, Tamson. "A British Sea: Making Sense of Global Space in the Late Nineteenth Century." *Journal of Global History* 5 (2010): 423-46.
- . *Empire of Scholars: Universities, Networks and the British Academic World, 1850-1939*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015.
- Popkewitz, Thomas. "Comparative Studies and Unthinking Comparative "Thought": The Paradox of "Reason" and Its Abjections." In *New Thinking in Comparative Education: Honouring Robert Cowen*, edited by M.Larsen, 15-28. London: Sense Publishers, 2010.
- "Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks." *The College News*, 14 December 1921.
- Robertson, Nancy M. *Christian Sisterhood, Race Relations, and the Ywca, 1906-46*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2007.
- Rosenberg, Emily S. *A World Connecting: 1870-1945*. Cambridge, Mass.; London: Harvard University Press, 2012.
- Rosselló, Pedro. *Forerunners of the International Bureau of Education: A Hitherto Unrecorded Aspect of the History of Education and of International Institutions*. Translated by Marie Butts. London: Evans Brothers Ltd., 1944.
- Rossoff, Nancy, and Stephanie Spencer. "Transnational Femininities: Fictions for Teenage Girls in the Uk and Us, 1910-1965."
- Sandell, Marie. "Learning in and from the West: International Students and International Women's Organisations in the Interwar Period." *History of Education* 44, no. 1 (2015/01/02 2014): 5-24.
- . "'A Real Meeting of the Women of the East and West': Women and Internationalism in the Interwar Period." In *Internationalism Reconfigured: Transnational Ideas and Movements between the World Wars*, edited by Daniel Laqua, 161-86. New York: I.B.Tauris & Co.Ltd, 2011.
- . *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood between the World Wars*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2015.
- Saunier, Pierre-Yves. *Transnational History*. London: Routledge, 2013.
- Schiller, Nina Glick, Tsypylma Darieva, and Sandra Gruner-Domic. "Defining Cosmopolitan Sociability in a Transnational Age. An Introduction." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34, no. 3 (2011): 399-418.
- SDN. *International Intellectual Co-Operation 1933*. Paris: International Institute of Intellectual Co-operation, 1934.

———. "Meeting of Representatives of International Student Organisations, Minutes of the Fourth Meeting Held on April 9 1926, Sdn Archive Geneva, Icic Box R1017.": SDN.

Sobe, Noah W. "Entanglement and Transnationalism in the History of American Education." In *Rethinking the History of Education: Transnational Perspectives on Its Questions, Methods, and Knowledge*, edited by Thomas S. Popkewitz, 93-107. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

———. *Provincializing the Worldly Citizen: Yugoslav Student and Teacher Travel and Slavic Cosmopolitanism in the Interwar Era*. Peter Lang, 2008.

Spencer, Stephanie. "Cosmopolitan Sociability in the British and International Federations of University Women, 1945–1960." *Women's History Review* (2016): 1-17.

Spurgeon, Caroline. "The Growth of the International Federation." In *Ifuw, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*, 18-19. London: IFUW, 1922.

Takahashi, Yuko. "Recent Collaborative Endeavors by Historians of Women and Gender in Japan." *Journal of Women's History* 25, no. 4 (2013): 244-54.

Tamboukou, Maria. *Women, Education and the Self: A Foucauldian Perspective*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2003.

Trentmann, Frank. "After the Nation-State: Citizenship, Empire and Global Coordination in the New Internationalism, 1914-1930." In *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism C.1880-1950*, edited by Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine and Frank Trentmann, 34-53. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005.

Tröhler, Daniel. *Languages of Education: Protestant Legacies, National Identities, and Global Aspirations*. London: Routledge, 2012.

Verbruggen, Christophe, and Julie Carlier. "An Entangled History of Ideas and Ideals: Feminism, Social and Educational Reform in Children's Libraries in Belgium before the First World War." *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 3 (2009): 291-308.

Vertovec, Steven. "Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22, no. 2 (1999/01/01 1999): 447-62.

von Oertzen, Christina. *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

Werner, Michael, and Bénédicte Zimmermann. "Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity." *History and Theory* 45, no. 1 (2006): 30-50.

Whitehead, Kay. "Vocation, Career and Character in Early Twentieth-Century Women Teachers' Work in City Schools." *History of Education* 34, no. 6 (2005/01/01 2005): 579-97.

YWCA. "Minutes of the Meetings of the World's Young Women's Christian Association Committee, Champéry, June 11-14, 1920." 1920.

Yamasaki, Yoko. "Educational Tourism and Its Impacts: Intercultural Interaction between Japan and the West at the Turn of the 19th to the 20th Century (Panel)." ISCHE 37 Istanbul, 2015.

———. "Yasui Tetsu (1870-1945) and Transcultural Influences in Educational Reforms for Women." ISCHE 37 Istanbul, 2015.

Yasutake, Rumi. "The Rise of Women's Internationalism in the Countries of the Asia-Pacific Region During the Interwar Years, from a Japanese Perspective." *Women's History Review* 20, no. 4 (2011/09/01 2011): 521-32.

YWCA. *How Wide Is Your Circle*. New York: YWCA, 1920.

———. "National Young Women's Christian Association, Proceedings of the Sixth National Convention Cleveland, Ohio, April 13-20, 1920." 1920.

Zimmerman, Susan. "The Challenge of Multinational Empire for the International Women's Movement: The Habsburg Monarchy and the Development of Feminist Inter/National Politics." *Journal of Women's History* 17, no. 2 (2005): 87-117.

Zimmern, Alfred E. "The Development of the International Mind." In *Problems of Peace: Lectures Delivered at the Geneva Inst. Of International Relations*, edited by Alfred E Zimmern, 1-17. Geneva: Institute of International Relations, 1932.

———. "Introductory." In *The War and Democracy*, edited by Arthur Greenwood, R.W. Seton-Watson, J Dover Wilson and Alfred E Zimmern, 1-17: London, 1914.

———. *The League of Nations and the Rule of Law: 1918 - 1935*. London: Macmillan, 1936.

Bibliography

- Akami, Tomoko. *Internationalizing the Pacific: The United States, Japan and the Institute of Pacific Relations in War and Peace, 1919-45*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Azuma, Eiichiro. *Between Two Empires : Race, History, and Transnationalism in Japanese America*. Oxford New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- . "'The Pacific Era Has Arrived': Transnational Education among Japanese Americans, 1932-1941." *History of Education Quarterly* 43, no. 1 (2003): 39-73.
- Berkovitch, Nitza. *From Motherhood to Citizenship*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1999.
- Bonnet, Henri. "Recent Developments in International Intellectual Co-Operation." *Information Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1932): 5.
- Bosanquet, Theodora. "The Aims and Record of the International Federation." In *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*. London: IFUW, 1929.
- Brinks, P.E. *Anglophone Indian Women Writers, 1870–1920*. Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2013.
- Burkman, Thomas W. *Japan and the League of Nations: Empire and World Order, 1914-1938*. Honolulu, T.H.: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008.
- Butler, Nicholas Murray. *The International Mind: An Argument for the Judicial Settlement of International Disputes*. New York: Shares Scribner's Sons, 1913.
- Carlier, Julie. "Forgotten Transnational Connections and National Contexts: An "Entangled History" of the Political Transfers That Shaped Belgian Feminism, 1890-1914." *Women's History Review* 19, no. 4 (2010): 502-33.
- Caruso, Marcelo. "World Systems, World Society, World Polity: Theoretical Insights for a Global History of Education." *History of Education* 37, no. 6 (2008): 825-40.
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh. *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2000.
- . "Universalism and Belonging in the Logic of Capital." In *Cosmopolitanism*, edited by Carol A. Breckenridge, Sheldon I. Pollock, Homi K. Bhabha and Dipesh Chakrabarty, 82-110. Durham: Duke University Press, 2002.
- Clavin, Patricia. "Defining Transnationalism." *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 2 (2005): 421-39.
- Clavin, Patricia, and Jens-Wilhelm Wessels. "Transnationalism and the League of Nations: Understanding the Work of Its Economic and Financial Organisation." *Contemporary European History* 14, no. 4 (2005): 465-92.
- Colley, Linda. *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World 1600-1850*. London: Jonathan Cape, 2002.
- Cunningham, Peter. "Educational Pioneering and Cultural Exchange: The Case of Elizabeth Hughes (1851-1925)." *ISCHE* 37 Istanbul, 2015.
- Deacon, Lesley, Penny Russell, and Angela Woollacott. "Introduction." In *Transnational Lives: Biographies of Colonial Modernity 1700-Present*, edited by Lesley Deacon, Penny Russell and Angela Woollacott, 1-11. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2010.
- Fabian, Johannes. *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes Its Object*. 2014 ed. New York: Columbia University Press, 1983.
- Fritz, Jan-Stefan. "Internationalism and the Promise of Science." In *Imperialism and Internationalism in the Discipline of International Relations*, edited by David Long and Brian C. Schmidt, 141-58. Albany: SUNY, 2005.
- Fuchs, Eckhardt. "History of Education Beyond the Nation? Trends in Historical and Educational Scholarship." In *Connecting Histories of Education: Transnational and*

- Cross-Cultural Exchanges in (Post-)Colonial Education*, edited by Barnita Bagchi, Eckhardt Fuchs and Kate Rousmaniere, 11-26. New York: Berghahn Books, 2014.
- Gildersleeve, Virginia Crocheron. "The Creation of the International Mind." In *Gildersleeve Collection*. Mss: Columbia University, nd.
- Goodman, Joyce. "'Their Market Value Must Be Greater for the Experience They Had Gained': Secondary School Headmistresses and Empire 1897-1914." In *Gender, Colonialism and Education: The Politics of Experience*, edited by Joyce Goodman and Jane Martin, 175-98. London: Woburn Press, 2002.
- . "Transatlantic Crossings and Professional Lives: Ellen Knox's Travel between Canada and England." *History of Education Researcher* 89, no. 36-44 (2012).
- Goodman, Joyce, Andrea Jacobs, Fiona Kisby, and Helen Loader. "Travelling Careers: Overseas Migration Patterns in the Professional Lives of Women Attending Girton and Newnham before 1939." *History of Education* 40, no. 2 (2011/03/01 2011): 179-96.
- Goodman, Joyce, Gary McCulloch, and William Richardson. "'Empires Overseas' and 'Empires at Home': Postcolonial and Transnational Perspectives on Social Change in the History of Education." *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 6 (2009/12/01 2009): 695-706.
- Grant, Kevin, Philippa Levine, and Frank Trentmann. "Introduction." In *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism c1880-1950*, edited by Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine and Frank Trentmann Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005.
- Hall, Catherine. *Civilising Subjects: Metropole and Colony in the English Imagination, 1830-1867*. Oxford: Polity, 2002.
- . "Histories, Empire and the Post-Colonial Question." In *The Postcolonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*, edited by Iain Chambers and Lidia Curti, 65-77. London: Routledge, 2002.
- . "Introduction: Thinking the Postcolonial, Thinking the Empire." In *Cultures of Empire: Colonizers in Britain and the Empire in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: A Reader*, edited by Catherine Hall, 1-36. London: Routledge, 2000.
- Hall, Catherine, and Sonya O Rose. "Introduction: Being at Home with the Empire." In *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*, edited by Catherine Hall and Sonya O. Rose, 1-31. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Hall, Catherine, and Sonya O. Rose, eds. *At Home with the Empire: Metropolitan Culture and the Imperial World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Hinder, Eleanor. "The Outcome of the First Pan Pacific Women's Conference, Honolulu August 9-19 1928." *Mid Pacific Magazine*, no. December (1928): 407-10.
- Hirst, Paul, Grahame Thompson, and Simon Bromley. *Globalization in Question: The International Economy and the Possibilities of Governance*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1996.
- ICIC. "Minutes of the Twelfth Session. Held at Geneva from Wednesday, July 23rd, to Tuesday, July 29th, 1930, 13 August 1930 [C.428.M.192.1930.X11 [C.I.C.I./12th Session/P.V.]]." (1930).
- IFUW. In Report of the First Conference, July, 1920, 1920.
- . "Committee on Intellectual Co-Operation." In *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW, 1928.
- . "Japan." In Report of the First Conference, July, 1920, 54. London: IFUW, 1920.
- . "List of Delegates." In *Ifuw, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW, 1922.

- . "Notes on the Constitution and Bye Laws." In *Report of the First Conference, 1920*. London: IFUW, 1920.
- . "Resolution - Intellectual Co-Operation." In *Twelfth Council Meeting, Madrid, 1928*. London: IFUW, 1928.
- . "Summary of Dr Von Zahn Harnack's Speech." In *Fifth Conference - Geneva, 1929*, 60-69. London: IFUW, 1929.
- . "The University Women of Japan." In *Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*, 30. London: IFUW, 1922.
- . "University Women of the East." In *Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*. London: IFUW, 1922.
- Iriye, Akira. *Cultural Internationalism and World Order*. Baltimore, Md. ; London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.
- . *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Iriye, Akira, and Pierre-Yves Saunier. *The Palgrave Dictionary of Transnational History: From the Mid-19th Century to the Present*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Kawai, M. *My Lantern*. Tokyo: Kyo Bun Kwan, 1940.
- Lambert, David, and Alan Lester. *Colonial Lives across the British Empire: Imperial Careerism in the Long Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- MacKenzie, John. "Empire and Metropolitan Cultures." In *The Oxford History of the British Empire: Volume Iii: The Nineteenth Century*, edited by Andrew Porter, 212-31. Oxford: OUP, 1999.
- Mangan, James A, ed. *Benefits Bestowed?: Education and British Imperialism*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1988.
- Massey, Doreen B. *For Space*. London: Sage, 2005.
- Mazlish, Bruce. "Comparing Global History to World History." *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 28, no. 3 (1998): 385-95.
- Mazlish, Bruce, and Akira Iriye. *The Global History Reader*. London: Routledge, 2005.
- Morefield, Jeanne. *Covenants without Swords: Idealist Liberalism and the Spirit of Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005.
- Ohukura, Kentaro, and Masako Shibata. "Globalization and Education in Japan." In *Globalization and the Study of Education*, edited by Thomas S. Popkewitz and Fazal Rizvi, 160-79. Malden Mass.: Blackwell, 2010.
- Paisley, Fiona. *Glamour in the Pacific: Cultural Internationalism and Race Politics in the Women's Pan-Pacific*. Honolulu: University of Hawai Press, 2009.
- Pietsch, Tamson. "A British Sea: Making Sense of Global Space in the Late Nineteenth Century." *Journal of Global History* 5 (2010): 423-46.
- . *Empire of Scholars: Universities, Networks and the British Academic World, 1850-1939*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015.
- Popkewitz, Thomas. "Comparative Studies and Unthinking Comparative "Thought": The Paradox of "Reason" and Its Abjections." In *New Thinking in Comparative Education: Honouring Robert Cowen*, edited by M.Larsen, 15-28. London: Sense Publishers, 2010.
- "Representative of Thousands of Japanese Women Speaks." *The College News*, 14 December 1921.
- Robertson, Nancy M. *Christian Sisterhood, Race Relations, and the Ywca, 1906-46*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2007.
- Rosenberg, Emily S. *A World Connecting: 1870-1945*. Cambridge, Mass.; London: Harvard University Press, 2012.

Rosselló, Pedro. *Forerunners of the International Bureau of Education: A Hitherto Unrecorded Aspect of the History of Education and of International Institutions*. Translated by Marie Butts. London: Evans Brothers Ltd., 1944.

Rossoff, Nancy, and Stephanie Spencer. "Transnational Femininities: Fictions for Teenage Girls in the Uk and Us, 1910-1965."

Sandell, Marie. "Learning in and from the West: International Students and International Women's Organisations in the Interwar Period." *History of Education* 44, no. 1 (2015/01/02 2014): 5-24.

———. *The Rise of Women's Transnational Activism: Identity and Sisterhood between the World Wars*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2015.

Sandell, Marie. "'A Real Meeting of the Women of the East and West': Women and Internationalism in the Interwar Period." In *Internationalism Reconfigured: Transnational Ideas and Movements between the World Wars*, edited by Daniel Laqua, 161-86. New York: I.B.Tauris Co.Ltd, 2011.

Saunier, Pierre-Yves. *Transnational History*. London: Routledge, 2013.

Schiller, Nina Glick, Tsypylma Darieva, and Sandra Gruner-Domic. "Defining Cosmopolitan Sociability in a Transnational Age. An Introduction." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34, no. 3 (2011): 399-418.

SDN. *International Intellectual Co-Operation 1933*. Paris: International Institute of Intellectual Co-operation, 1934.

———. "Meeting of Representatives of International Student Organisations, Minutes of the Fourth Meeting Held on April 9 1926, Sdn Archive Geneva, Icic Box R1017.": SDN.

Sobe, Noah W. "Entanglement and Transnationalism in the History of American Education." In *Rethinking the History of Education: Transnational Perspectives on Its Questions, Methods, and Knowledge*, edited by Thomas S. Popkewitz, 93-107. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

———. *Provincializing the Worldly Citizen: Yugoslav Student and Teacher Travel and Slavic Cosmopolitanism in the Interwar Era*. Peter Lang, 2008.

Spencer, Stephanie. "Cosmopolitan Sociability in the British and International Federations of University Women, 1945–1960." *Women's History Review* (2016): 1-17.

Spurgeon, Caroline. "The Growth of the International Federation." In *Ifuw, Report of the Second Conference, July, 1922*, 18-19. London: IFUW, 1922.

Takahashi, Yuko. "Recent Collaborative Endeavors by Historians of Women and Gender in Japan." *Journal of Women's History* 25, no. 4 (2013): 244-54.

Tamboukou, Maria. *Women, Education and the Self: A Foucauldian Perspective*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2003.

Trentmann, Frank. "After the Nation-State: Citizenship, Empire and Global Coordination in the New Internationalism, 1914-1930." In *Beyond Sovereignty: Britain, Empire and Transnationalism C.1880-1950*, edited by Kevin Grant, Philippa Levine and Frank Trentmann, 34-53. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2005.

Tröhler, Daniel. *Languages of Education: Protestant Legacies, National Identities, and Global Aspirations*. London: Routledge, 2012.

Verbruggen, Christophe, and Julie Carlier. "An Entangled History of Ideas and Ideals: Feminism, Social and Educational Reform in Children's Libraries in Belgium before the First World War." *Paedagogica Historica* 45, no. 3 (2009): 291-308.

Vertovec, Steven. "Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22, no. 2 (1999/01/01 1999): 447-62.

von Oertzen, Christina. *Science, Gender, and Internationalism: Women's Academic Networks, 1917-1955*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

- Werner, Michael, and Bénédicte Zimmermann. "Beyond Comparison: Histoire Croisée and the Challenge of Reflexivity." *History and Theory* 45, no. 1 (2006): 30-50.
- Whitehead, Kay. "Vocation, Career and Character in Early Twentieth-Century Women Teachers' Work in City Schools." *History of Education* 34, no. 6 (2005/01/01 2005): 579-97.
- YWCA. "Minutes of the Meetings of the World's Young Women's Christian Association Committee, Champéry, June 11-14, 1920." 1920.
- Yamasaki, Yoko. "Educational Tourism and Its Impacts: Intercultural Interaction between Japan and the West at the Turn of the 19th to the 20th Century (Panel)." ISCHE 37 Istanbul, 2015.
- . "Yasui Tetsu (1870-1945) and Transcultural Influences in Educational Reforms for Women ". ISCHE 37 Istanbul, 2015.
- Yasutake, Rumi. "The Rise of Women's Internationalism in the Countries of the Asia-Pacific Region During the Interwar Years, from a Japanese Perspective." *Women's History Review* 20, no. 4 (2011/09/01 2011): 521-32.
- YWCA. *How Wide Is Your Circle*. New York: YWCA, 1920.
- . "National Young Women's Christian Association, Proceedings of the Sixth National Convention Cleveland, Ohio, April 13-20, 1920." 1920.
- Zimmerman, Susan. "The Challenge of Multinational Empire for the International Women's Movement: The Habsburg Monarchy and the Development of Feminist Inter/National Politics." *Journal of Women's History* 17, no. 2 (2005): 87-117.
- Zimmern, Alfred E. "The Development of the International Mind." In *Problems of Peace: Lectures Delivered at the Geneva Inst. Of International Relations*, edited by Alfred E Zimmern, 1-17. Geneva: Institute of International Relations, 1932.
- . "Introductory." In *The War and Democracy*, edited by Arthur Greenwood, R.W. Seton-Watson, J Dover Wilson and Alfred E Zimmern, 1-17: London, 1914.
- . *The League of Nations and the Rule of Law: 1918 - 1935*. London: Macmillan, 1936.